

## CITY OF ESCONDIDO

### MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE ESCONDIDO PLANNING COMMISSION

December 13, 2011

The meeting of the Escondido Planning Commission was called to order at 7:00 p.m. by Chairman Caster, in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

**Commissioners present:** Jack Campbell, Vice-chairman; Guy Winton, Commissioner; Darol Caster, Chairman; Jeffery Weber, Commissioner; Edward Lehman, Commissioner; and Don Yerkes, Commissioner.

**Commissioners absent:** Bob McQuead, Commissioner.

**Staff present:** Bill Martin, Principal Planner; Jay Paul, Associate Planner; Owen Tunnell, Associate Engineer; Gary McCarthy, Senior Deputy City Attorney; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

#### **MINUTES:**

Moved by Commissioner Lehman, seconded by Commissioner Weber, to approve the minutes of the November 22, 2011, meeting. Motion carried unanimously. (6-0)

**WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS** – Received.

**FUTURE NEIGHBORHOOD MEETINGS** – Received.

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS** – None.

#### **PUBLIC HEARINGS:**

1. **SPECIFIC PLAN AMENDMENT – PHG 11-0010 (Continued from November 22, 2011):**

REQUEST: An Amendment to the Palos Vista Specific Plan to remove the existing AT&T wireless communication facility located on the site and replace the older simulated tree with a new simulated tree to accommodate additional panel antennas and radio equipment. The existing AT&T facility was designed to accommodate up to six, six-foot-high panel antennas. The new structure would consist of a 35-foot-high simulated tree (40 feet to top of branches) that is designed to accommodate up to twelve, eight-foot-high panel antennas. Additional radio and electrical equipment would be located within the existing masonry block equipment enclosure.

LOCATION: Lot G-G-1 of Tract No. 683, addressed as 1901 Woodland Heights Glen (APN 187-720-23)

Jay Paul, Associate Planner, referenced the staff report and noted staff's issue was whether the design and location of the proposed facility is appropriate for the site and consistent with the Wireless Facility Guidelines. Staff recommended approval based on the following: 1) The proposed facility would be consistent with the Communication Antennas Ordinance since the antennas would be incorporated into a simulated tree, which is a stealthy design and would be in context with the surrounding open space setting and other simulated trees on the site. The facility would not result in any adverse individual or cumulative visual impacts; is located on a large open-space lot; blends in with the surrounding built environment; and would be in conformance with FCC emission standards; and 2) Staff felt the proposed facility would not result in potential health hazards to nearby residents since the Radio Frequency (RF) study prepared for the proposed project indicates the facility would be within maximum permissible exposure (MPE) limits and Federal Communication Commission (FCC) standards.

Commissioner Winton asked if the City boundary could be included on the wireless coverage maps.

Discussion ensued regarding a clarification of the RF calculations.

**Franklyn Morasco, AT&T representative**, concurred with staff's recommendation.

**ACTION:**

Moved by Commissioner Campbell, seconded by Commissioner Winton, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously. (6-0)

**2. CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT AND ZONE CHANGE – PHG 11-0017:**

REQUEST: A Conditional Use Permit for the reconstruction of an approximately 5,421 SF, single-story fire station (Fire Station No. 4) for the Escondido Fire Department in conjunction with a Zone Change to apply the Public Safety Facilities Overlay Zone to the approximately one-acre site located in Kit Carson Park. The existing fire station is currently vacant and would be partially demolished and enlarged to include three apparatus bays for emergency response vehicles, living quarters, equipment/gear storage and an exercise room. Access into the site would continue to be provided from the park road that is part of a signalized intersection with Bear Valley Parkway. Ten employee parking spaces are proposed on the southern part of the site along with an emergency generator and hose drying rack, all of which would be located within a fenced area.

LOCATION: The 0.99-acre site is located in Kit Carson Park on the southeastern corner of the intersection of Bear Valley Parkway and the park access road directly across from Mary Lane, addressed as 3301 Bear Valley Parkway.

Bill Martin, Principal Planner, referenced the staff report and noted staff issues were whether the design of the proposed fire station is compatible with surrounding development, and the appropriateness of applying the Public Safety Facilities (PSF) Overlay Zone to the site. Staff recommended approval based on the following: 1) The reconstruction and expansion of Fire Station No. 4 was necessary to remediate the current mold problem and meet the ongoing and future demand for fire services throughout the City. The new facility would provide adequate parking and access and would substantially conform to the required development standards of the OS-P zone. One minor setback deviation would be needed for the two public parking spaces in front of the station. Although the fire station would nearly double in size, the mass, scale and height of the new fire station would be compatible with the character and scale of the various Kit Carson Park recreational buildings directly behind the station and the high school campus and religious facility across Bear Valley Parkway to the east. The proposed exterior materials and colors for the facility also would be consistent with other structures located in the park; and 2) The City had an obligation to provide a sufficient number of public safety facilities in all areas of the City. The Public Safety Facilities (PSF) Overlay Zone comprehensively addresses the need to provide such facilities in each zone by providing flexibility in the development standards that were tailored to the specific underlying zoning designation. Although a fire station currently exists on the site, the underlying Open Space zone did not allow the development of a fire station. Applying the PSF Overlay Zone to the subject site would allow the reconstruction of the fire station within the Open Space (OS-P) zone, and also allow a minor deviation from the OS-P development standards to accommodate all of the on-site physical and operational needs of the Fire Department without adversely affecting adjacent properties. Staff feels implementation of the PSF Overlay Zone was a more comprehensive method to deal with the unique needs of this essential service facility while still providing discretionary oversight through the Conditional Use Permit process.

Chairman Caster questioned whether the Fire Department was concerned with the level of service on Bear Valley Parkway being LOS "F." Mr. Martin replied in the negative and noted the reconstructed station would not generate more traffic than previously occurred.

Commissioner Yerkes and Fire Division Chief Russ Knowles discussed the traffic patterns during peak periods on Bear Valley Parkway when the emergency vehicles were exiting the station.

**ACTION:**

Moved by Commissioner Winton, seconded by Commissioner Weber, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously. (6-0)

**CURRENT BUSINESS:**

**1. Report on the effectiveness of the new light shields installed on the athletic field lights at Calvin Christian High School (PHG 08-0018).**

Mr. Martin provided the update and noted that the shields had been installed and had effectively reduced light and glare in the adjacent neighborhood. He noted that he had spoken to one of the concerned neighbors the night he was inspecting the lights and that she agreed the situation had improved. Planning staff had informed the Code Enforcement Division that the violations had been corrected and the case could be closed. He stated that no further action on the part of the Planning Commission was recommended.

**Mark Meumelaar, Escondido, President of the School Board at Calvin Christian**, stated that they had conducted some independent testing of the lighting by a third party and found the levels to be below the required levels from the CUP.

The Planning Commission concurred to take no further action.

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:** None.

**PLANNING COMMISSIONERS:**

Commissioner Winton and Mr. Martin discussed what version of the minutes was posted on the City's website.

**ADJOURNMENT:**

Chairman Caster adjourned the meeting at 7:36 p.m. The next meeting was scheduled for January 10, 2012, at 7:00 p.m. in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

---

Bill Martin, Secretary to the Escondido  
Planning Commission

---

Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk