

CITY OF ESCONDIDO

**MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION**

October 4, 2016

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Rea in City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Chair Rea, Vice-chair Spann, Commissioner Correll, Commissioner Hanwit and Commissioner Lee.

Commissioners absent: Commissioner Breitenfeld and Commissioner Danskin.

Staff present: Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II; and Eva Heter, Assistant City Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Hanwit, to approve the minutes of the August 2, 2016, meeting. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: Received.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:

1. LOCAL REGISTER & MILLS ACT – Case No. HP 16-0007:

REQUEST: Local Register Listing & Mills Act Contract for Residence in the OEN

LOCATION: 1106 South Juniper Street

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the staff report and made special reference to the Mills Act contract's Improvements List, suggesting that the existing historic shed and garage also be added. Staff recommended forwarding a recommendation of approval to City Council for the Local Register listing request, Mills Act contract request, and consideration of the proposed CEQA exemption.

Commissioner Hanwit questioned whether listed improvement items could be prioritized, noting her view that the replacement of the vinyl windows could be done after the initial health and safety items were completed. She also questioned the appropriateness of the shutter replacements. Mr. Bingham noted that the code did not set out prioritizing improvement items for Mills Act contracts; however, this did not preclude the Commission from making such a suggestion part of their recommendation to City Council.

Vice-chair Spann expressed concern with prioritizing items, feeling necessity would naturally occur with said items.

Commissioner Correll felt health and safety items would be a first priority.

Vice-chair Spann and Commissioner Correll both concurred with staff's recommendations.

Chair Rea questioned whether there were other properties on the Local Register and Mills Act with vinyl windows. Mr. Bingham noted that any such properties were conditioned to replace said windows.

Chair Rea concurred with the health and safety items taking priority but also felt the replacement of the vinyl windows should be done fairly quickly. She agreed that the shutters were not appropriate for the property. She recommended that the contract's Improvements List also include the removal of the skylights.

Vice-chair Spann stated that he did not mind the solar tubes.

The Commission suggested prioritizing the maintenance list as follows: First the public health and safety items 3, 8, 9, 10 and 11; and second the remainder of the list beginning with window replacement.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Correll, to approve staff's recommendation, including the addition of the historic shed and garage to the contract. The motion included that the contract's Improvement List be further modified as follows: 1) Remove item 6 for shutter replacement, 2) Add skylight removal, 3) Prioritize health and safety items 3-railing, 8-electical, 9-termite damage, 10-foundation and 11-plumbing; and 4) Prioritize replacement of the vinyl windows as number one of the remaining items. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

2. LOCAL REGISTER & MILLS ACT – Case No. HP 16-0006:

REQUEST: Local Register Listing & Mills Act Contract for Residence in the OEN

LOCATION: 440 East 7th Avenue

Chair Rea recused herself from Item 2 due to her property's proximity to the subject site.

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the staff report and made special reference to the siding needing to be added to the Mills Act Improvement List. Staff recommended forwarding a recommendation of approval to City Council for the Local Register listing request, Mills Act contract request, and consideration of the proposed CEQA exemption.

Jodi Ostrom, Escondido, Applicant, concurred with wrapping the siding around to the front of the residence and noted this could be included in the contract's Improvement List. She also indicated that her family (Clevenger) was one of the first settlers in the San Pasqual Valley and Ramona area.

Commissioner Hanwit asked Ms. Ostrom if the bathroom had some leaking issues. Ms. Ostrom noted that the Improvement List was not in any particular order, adding that the subject bathroom was not being used at this time but was being repaired soon. She noted that she was looking into changing out the windows with something period appropriate. She also indicated that she preferred the Queen Anne style.

Vice-chair Spann stated that he would like to see siding replace stucco throughout the exterior of the residence as well as the existing garage and asked that these items be added to the Improvement List. He also felt the owner should have the choice between going with a Queen Anne or Craftsman style.

Commissioner Hanwit was in favor of the Queen Anne style since this was the original style of the home.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Correll, seconded by Commissioner Lee, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion included recommending modifying the maintenance list to add stucco removal and wood siding replacement on the house and garage. Motion carried. Ayes: Spann, Hanwit, Correll, and Lee. Noes: None. Abstained: Rea. (4-0-1)

3. LOCAL REGISTER & MILLS ACT – Case No. HP 16-0005:

REQUEST: Local Register Listing & Mills Act Contract for Residence in the OEN

LOCATION: 535 East 9th Avenue

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the staff report and made special reference to the list of improvements for the subject property. Staff recommended forwarding a recommendation of approval to City Council for the Local Register listing request, Mills Act contract request, and consideration of the proposed CEQA exemption.

Commissioner Hanwit asked if the windows were original.

Kirsten Sepich, Escondido, Applicant, replied in the affirmative, noting she was investigating more functional, energy and era specific windows.

Commissioner Hanwit expressed her concern with the looks of the security light in front of the residence. Ms. Sepich noted she would be willing to put something up that was more era specific if available.

Chair Rea suggested utilizing a motion detector or timer for the subject light. She also noted that insulated windows tended to have issues, suggesting that they retain the original windows and utilize landscaping and interior window coverings to help reduce noise and improve R-value. She also suggested using wooden fencing material.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Correll, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion included revising the contract's Improvement List to include changing the security light with something era appropriate, retaining the existing windows, and utilizing dog-eared cedar for fencing material. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

**CURRENT BUSINESS:****1. MILLS ACT – Case No. HP 16-0009:**

REQUEST: Mills Act for Local Register Residence

LOCATION: 178 Howell Heights

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided the description and background history for the subject property as well as going over the Improvement List. Staff recommended the Commission forward a recommendation of approval to City Council for the Mills Act Contract.

Commissioners Hanwit and Lee were in favor of the list of proposed improvements.

Commissioner Correll felt the front door should be replaced with something more period appropriate.

Chair Rea felt concrete would be another option for the front driveway, noting her concern with the expense of utilizing modern pavers.

ACTION:


Moved by Commissioner Lee, seconded by Vice-chair Spann, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion included adding an item to the Improvement List to change the front door to a period specific door and allowing gravel, or period appropriate pavers or concrete for the new driveway. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

2. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE No. ADM 16-0138:

REQUEST: Demolish Existing Historic Survey Residence in Order to Construct Apartments

Location: 350 North Juniper

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided a description and background history for the subject property in the Creekside Neighborhood. He also provided a brief overview of the architectural analysis and noted that the property was uninhabitable and in very poor shape. He then provided an overview of the proposed development plan and requested input from the Commission.



Commissioner Correll felt it would be in the best interest of the community to demolish the structure given the previous illegal modifications and resulting damage to the residence. Vice-chair Spann and Commissioner Lee concurred.

Commissioner Hanwit expressed her concern with demolishing the subject structure.

The Architect for the property indicated that at first glance the residence appeared salvageable, but noted that there was nothing original left on the house. He also noted that issues included no foundation under part of the house, structure was open to water/air/insects, removal of wood siding, a bowed roof structure, and un-useable plumbing/electrical/mechanical systems.

Chair Rea asked the architect if the house was on a foundation. The architect indicated that the house was on a raised foundation. Chair Rea asked if the residence could be relocated. The architect indicated that the interior would have to be reframed, additions removed, and siding replaced, noting his view that the work would be too extensive.

Chair Rea questioned whether the front door could be salvaged. The architect indicated that he would look into this.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Hanwit, to approve the request to demolish the residence located at 350 North Juniper. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

3. DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 16-0126:

REQUEST: Proposed Second Dwelling Unit Attached to Historic Survey Residence.

LOCATION: 1661 Felicita Lane

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided a description and background history for the subject property. He then provided some context photos and noted that the request was to add a second dwelling unit on to the main house. Staff recommended approval.

David Halttunen, Architect, San Marcos, provided an overview of the proposed addition and noted that the addition would blend well with the original residence.

Vice-chair Spann asked who would reside in the second dwelling unit. Mr. Halttunen noted that the daughter would reside in the unit. Mr. Bingham noted that the only restriction would be that a family member reside in one of the units. This requirement would be accomplished through a deed restriction.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Correll, to approve staff's recommendation. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

4. DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 16-0107:

REQUEST: Review Revisions to Proposed Room Additions for OEN Residence

LOCATION: 740 Beacon Place

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided the description and background history for the subject property, noting that the HPC previously reviewed the project in August 2016. He then provided an overview of the proposed revisions.

He noted that staff recommended approval of the proposed revisions to the room additions.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Correll, seconded by Commissioner Hanwit, to approve staff's recommendations. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

5. PROPOSED ZONING CODE AMENDMENT – Case No. AZ 16-006:

Request comments on draft citywide code amendment including changing the review authority for 2nd Dwelling Units in the OEN historic district to an administrative application with HPC design review, and changing requests for Local Register Listing to an administrative HPC current business item.

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner, provided the staff report and reviewed the summary of proposed changes. She also stated that the code amendment incorporated the Commission's recommendation to allow detached second dwelling units over a detached garage and off of alleys in the OEN. Staff recommended approval of the proposed zoning code amendment.

Commissioner Hanwit noted no concerns with the amendment.

Commissioner Correll stated that he was not familiar enough with the process but relied on staff's recommendation.

Vice-chair Spann was in favor of the amendment, feeling it would help streamline the process.

Chair Rea was in favor of streamlining the process. She also noted that she would prefer citizen review on Item 9 for larger signs. Mrs. Cherry noted that there was very little change in that process.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Correll, seconded by Commissioner Hanwit, to approve staff's recommendations. Motion carried unanimously. (5-0)

6. PROPOSED BOUNDARY CHANGE BETWEEN THE OEN HISTORIC DISTRICT AND THE DRAFT SOUTH CENTRE CITY AREA PLAN

Request preliminary comments on the proposed adjustment to the district boundaries to coordinate with existing zoning and the boundaries of the future area plan.

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner, provided the staff report and an overview of the OEN Historic District and draft South Centre City Area Plan. Staff recommended approval to modify the boundaries of the Old Escondido Neighborhood Historic District as shown on Attachment 2 in the staff report.

Vice-chair Spann referenced the property on 9th Avenue between Escondido Boulevard and Maple Street, noting his view that this was a significant historic house.

Chair Rea questioned whether the impacted historic houses would continue to be protected. Mrs. Cherry noted that they would still go through the same process for any redevelopment of a property with a historic structure.

Commissioner Correll asked if the property owners had an opinion about being taken out of the OEN. Mrs. Cherry noted that the property owners had not been contacted yet, noting this was in the rough draft stage. She stated community outreach would occur when the draft was finalized.

Discussion ensued regarding the status of the property at 248 West 9th Avenue.

Chair Rea noted that the two homes on Escondido Boulevard were historic and should be protected, feeling they should not be taken out of the OEN.

Vice-chair Spann expressed his concern with losing the 9th Avenue and 13th Avenue properties to commercial. Commissioner Correll concurred.

Chair Rea expressed her view that anything in the historic district should remain in the historic district with the exception of businesses.

**The consensus of the Commission was to keep the existing residences in the OEN, consider putting an overlay on said properties for adaptive reuse, and to keep the apartment property on 8th Avenue in the OEN.

7. AD HOC WORK GROUP REPORT ON UPDATING THE CITY'S HISTORIC GUIDELINES

Chair Rea provided the update and noted that they were moving along. Commissioner Danskin has created a spreadsheet to track changes and Commissioners Rea and Hanwit are composing sections. They believed they would be able to provide a draft at the next meeting.

8. AD HOC WORK GROUP REPORT ON MILLS ACT PROPERTIES

Chair Rea stated that they were still waiting for letters.

9. DISCUSSION REGARDING CHANGING HPC MEETING DAYS TO THE THIRD THURSDAY OF EVERY OTHER MONTH

The consensus of the Commission was to change the meeting to the third Thursday every other month beginning in 2017.

Commissioner Correll left the meeting at this time.


ORAL COMMUNICATIONS - None.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Chair Rea expressed her enthusiasm with the work being completed on the Italianate at 447 East 6th Avenue. She also thanked the City for the investment of new trees, curbs and sidewalks in the OEN.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 5:00 p.m. The next regular meeting was scheduled for December 6, 2016 at 3:00 p.m.



Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner

Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk