

CITY OF ESCONDIDO**MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION****June 7, 2016**

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:00 p.m. by Chair Rea in City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Chair Rea, Vice-chair Spann, Commissioner Harwit, Commissioner Correll, Commissioner Danskin and Commissioner Breitenfeld.

Commissioners absent: Commissioner Lee.

Staff present: Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Chair Rea, to approve the minutes of the April 5, 2016, meeting as amended. Motion carried unanimously. Commissioner Danskin was absent from the vote. (5-0)

WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: None.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.

PUBLIC HEARINGS:**1. LOCAL REGISTER & DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. HP 16-0001:**

REQUEST: Local Register of a Weir Brothers' Adobe & Design Review of Modifications including Garage Conversion, Connecting Carport and Pool House Additions.

Location: 2612 Loma Vista Avenue

Commissioner Danskin entered the meeting at this time.

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided a description and the background and code enforcement history for the subject property. He stated that the code enforcement issue might not be applicable due to the possibility that some revisions were done when the property was still in the County prior to annexation. He then referenced the design review items for the property and noted that staff recommended approval to list the subject property on the Local Register.

The Commission recommended taking separate actions on the following items:

**Original Single Bay Garage Bay Conversion into a Kitchen
Discussion/Action:**

Commissioner Hanwit asked if any of the individuals were available to speak about how and when the modifications were done. Mr. Bingham replied in the negative.

Commissioner Breitenfeld asked staff if the conversion altered the outline of the original house. Mr. Bingham replied in the negative, noting staff felt the single bay garage could be put back to its original condition very easily.

Commissioner Danskin and Mr. Bingham discussed potential building permits that might be required.

Commissioner Danskin noted no aesthetic issues but felt it might be difficult to determine whether the foundation was adequate to handle the load.

Chair Rea noted no issue with the aesthetics but felt it was important to determine when the modifications were done, especially if a Mills Act Contract were ever considered.

Vice-chair Spann felt the carport and workshop had been in existence for a long time, noting no issue with the garage conversion.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Correll, to approve the garage conversion into a kitchen as long as it met Building standards. Motion carried unanimously.

Large Breezeway Roof Discussion/Action**ACTION:**

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Correll, to direct staff to work with the applicant to obtain the approvals needed for the breezeway and roof. Motion carried unanimously.

Construction of Detached 6-Column Carport Discussion/Action**ACTION:**

Moved by Chair Rea, seconded by Commissioner Danskin, to direct staff to work with the applicant and involve engineering if needed. Motion carried unanimously.

Convert Adobe carport to Pool House Discussion/Action

Vice-chair Spann noted no issue with the carport being converted to living space and being listed on the Historic Register.

Discussion ensued regarding deed restricting the pool house.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Chair Rea, to approve the carport conversion as a habitable space. Motion carried unanimously.

Local Register Discussion/Action

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, noted that the property met three of the seven criteria for listing on the Local Register.

Commissioner Danskin encouraged the applicant to conduct some research on the former owners.

Angelika Nederlof, Applicant, noted that she had conducted extensive research and found that most of the individuals involved with the house were deceased.

Commissioner Correll noted that Dan Daugherty who owned Black Rock Pools might be a resource for information.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Danskin, to approve staff's recommendation to nominate the property located at 2612 Loma Vista Avenue to the Local Register. Motion carried unanimously.

2. MILLS ACT – Case No. HP 16-0002:

REQUEST: Local Register and Mills Act for the East Lake Victorian Stewart House

Location: 439 East 5th Avenue

Chair Rea and Commissioner Hanwit recused themselves from Item 2.

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, referenced the staff report and provided a description and background history for the subject property. He noted that staff felt the property met 5 of the 7 criteria for the Local Register listing. He then referenced the application's Improvement List for Mills Act listing. He noted that staff wanted to ensure that the new owners repair/replace the shaped wall shingles (scales) that had been changed on the residence as well as remove the gable attic window installed without approvals. Staff recommended approval of the property being listed on the Local Register and that it be placed on the Mills Act.

Commissioner Danskin and Mr. Bingham discussed the proposed wall shingle issue that staff was suggesting be addressed.

Commissioner Danskin asked if the attic gable had a window in the past. Mr. Bingham replied in the negative. Commissioner Spann noted that the historic picture of the house showed no window or vent.

Commissioner Danskin and staff discussed the purpose of the shiplap siding proposed for the Chimney.

Claire Green, Applicant, Escondido, noted that the reason for the shiplap was to try and keep the chimney pieces from crumbling during adverse weather.

Commissioner Danskin noted shiplap was not a structural solution but would help with protection from adverse weather. He felt it might be worth looking into a spray sealer that would help preserve both the material and looks of the chimney. He also felt the structural integrity of the chimney should be looked at.

Vice-chair Spann concurred with Commissioner Danskin and suggested amending Improvement List Item No. 4, feeling shiplap was not an appropriate material to be used. He felt the chimney should be restored to its original condition.

Discussion ensued regarding a clarification of the easement for the subject property as outlined in Exhibit A.

Commissioner Danskin asked if the applicant was okay with removing the window from the attic gable, noting this was not foreign to the style of the residence. Mr. Bingham suggested that staff work with the applicant on an appropriate window replacement.

Tracey Bass, Escondido, noted that the original owners constructed the residence for their mother and then lot split it when it was sold. She noted that the window in the attic gable was installed in order to cover a hole from where a beehive was removed, feeling it should be removed.

Commissioner Danskin felt the attic gable window should be smaller but did not feel it was foreign to the style of house as long as it was an appropriate window. Commissioner Breitenfeld concurred as long as it matched the rest of the residence.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Danskin, seconded by Commissioner Correll, to approve staff's recommendation. The motion included modifying Item No. 4 on the Mills Act Improvement List to attempt to preserve the existing chimney without shiplap, that staff work with the applicant regarding installing an appropriate window for the attic gable, and that the owners repair/replace the shaped wall shingles. Motion carried. Ayes: Danskin, Breitenfeld, Spann, and Correll. Noes: None. Abstained: Rea and Hanwit. (4-0-2)

CURRENT BUSINESS:

1. DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 16-0070:

REQUEST: Legalize small addition at rear of OEN residence

Location: 245 East 10th Avenue

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided a description and the background history for the subject property and noted that the property was not on the Local Register. He stated that this was a code enforcement case and staff was looking to the Commission as to the appropriateness of the closet addition at the rear of the house, if the addition could obtain a building permit. Staff recommended approval with the condition to stucco and paint the closet addition to match the exterior of the bedroom.

Discussion ensued regarding clarifications of the size of the bedroom, the age of the residence, and materials used for the addition.

Vice-chair Spann expressed no issues with the addition as long as staff and code enforcement approved the addition. He also felt the finish should match the rest of the residence.

Chair Rea expressed no issues with the addition but felt stucco would be more appropriate for the addition.

Commissioner Danskin expressed no issues with the addition as long as staff concurred.

Chair Rea felt the property had potential to be on the Local Register since it was in the OEN.

ACTION:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Danskin, to approve staff's recommendation. Ayes: Danskin, Rea, Spann, Correll and Hanwit. Noes: Breitenfeld (5-1-0)

2. AD HOC WORK GROUP REPORT ON UPDATING THE CITY'S HISTORIC GUIDELINES

Chair Rea noted the group was making progress and would be meeting again in June. She also noted that the introduction was almost finished.

3. AD HOC WORK GROUP REPORT ON MILLS ACT PROPERTIES

Chair Rea noted that some second visit letters were in order for those who did not respond, but that they were also ready for some new letters to be sent out.

4. DISCUSS POSSIBLE TRAINING WEBINAR TOPIC AND DATES

Mr. Bingham noted that he had reviewed the list of archived webinar subjects that seemed appropriate for the Commission and asked which ones the Commission would be interested in viewing.

The Commissioners requested the following webinars:

Rea - No. 3.
Breitenfeld – Nos. 2, 4, and 5.
Danskin – No. 3
Correll – Nos. 4 and 5
Hanwit – Nos. 3 and 4
Spann – All (1-5)

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS - None.


COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Commissioner Danskin suggested that the site plans and exhibits that were on the whiteboards be printed in a smaller scale so that each Commission could review them.

Chair Rea thanked staff for the Historic Awards presentation. She noted that the OEN Mother's Day Home Tour was a great success with over 700 attendees. She indicated that the Escondido History Center was providing a shelf for the Old Escondido Historic District in the former library that would be used for books relating to historic homes.

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 4:11 pm. The next regular meeting was scheduled for August 2, 2016 at 3:00 p.m.



Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner



Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk