

CITY OF ESCONDIDO
MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

MAY 17, 2018

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:00 by Chair Rea in Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Chair Rea, Vice-chair Spann, Commissioner Breitenfeld, Commissioner Correll, Commissioner Cowan, Commissioner Hanwit, Commissioner Purvis.

Commissioners absent: None.

Staff present: Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II; Adam Finestone, Principal Planner; Jay Paul, Senior Planner; and Eva Heter, Assistant City Clerk.

SWEARING IN OF NEW COMMISSIONERS:

Assistant City Clerk Heter administered the oath to Marc Correll, Errol Cowan, Nicole Purvis, and James Spann.

SELECTION OF CHAIR, VICE-CHAIR AND DETERMINATION OF SEATING ORDER

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Correll, seconded by Commissioner Spann, to nominate Commissioner Rea to Chairman. Motion carried unanimously.

ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Correll, seconded by Commissioner Hanwit, to nominate Commissioner Spann to Vice-chairman. Motion carried unanimously.

MINUTES:

Moved by Vice-chair Spann, seconded by Commissioner Correll, to approve the minutes of the March 8, 2018 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATION:

Adam Finestone, Principal Planner, provided packets of plans for Items J.2 and J.3, and the Advisory Body Handbook, updated March 2018.

ORAL COMMUNICATION: None

PUBLIC HEARINGS: None

CURRENT BUSINESS:**J.1 DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. PHG 18-0011**

REQUEST: Proposed Remodel of the Historic Ritz Theater Building

LOCATION: 301-309 East Grand Avenue

Jay Paul, Senior Planner, made a correction to the agenda, indicating that Tim Cruz is the Project Manager, not the Architect. He provided an overview of the proposed project utilizing a PowerPoint presentation. He requested Commissioner input on the proposed project, including signage and architectural design (i.e., marquee, signage, renovation of theatre and new two-story building). Senior Planner Paul noted the building would also include roll-down security grills.

Tim Cruz, Plain Joe Studios, provided an overview of the project by utilizing a PowerPoint Presentation. He indicated the existing footprint of the site was being maintained; however, the corner building would be demolished and replaced with a new two-story building. He reviewed the outside seating, café, and lounge area. He presented before and after project design photos of the interior and exterior of the building(s), and requested input from the Commission regarding the design of the project.

Commissioner Cowan questioned if the typed face of the marquee, shown in the presentation photos, was the proposed format for the lettering on the signage.

Senior Planner Paul stated the lettering format, shown in the photos, was just for discussion and only provides the initial concept to the design. The format of the typed face of the marquee would be changeable copies, displaying various event titles for the location.

Commissioner Cowan also questioned the type face of the upright feature, further stating that an older typeface may help to reflect the era of the structure. He felt the initial design proposal was more engrossing and attractive, and the second proposal seemed rather stark. However, he felt that neither of the two proposals adequately feature the historic/original building. He stated the project would be quite a significant feature for downtown and additional time to review the proposal would have been beneficial.

Commissioner Purvis stated she felt as though the project design represented a false sense of history. She referred back to the slide 8 of the power point presentation and requested clarification on the proposed demolition of the corner building, questioning if the building was on a local registry/survey. She questioned if there were any original architectural features present on the corner building that could be preserved, and inquired as to why the proposal wasn't presented to reconstruct the original structural design of the building.

Senior Planner Paul confirmed that the corner building was being proposed for demolition, further stating that the building was on a local registry/survey. A historical analysis had been conducted, approximately 10 years ago for the theatre building, which determined that there was a lack of original features, due to the amount of changes/modification, and did not to meet the criteria to be determined a significant historic resource.

Commissioner Hanwit stated the emphasis of the project should be on the original theatre marquee and the second marquee should be much smaller. She also noted she was not in favor of demolishing the corner site. She felt the arched windows presented in the renderings did not match the art deco design of the buildings

Commissioner Correll stated he appreciated the proposal and the intended uses; however, he felt that parking was a concern for the location. He questioned if it was within the Commissions purview to discuss use of the location.

Principal Planner Finestone stated the project being presented to the Commission is relative to design issues, not the issue of land use.

Vice-chair Spann recalled a previous proposal for the site, and the determination that the site not authentic enough to restore. He was in favor of restoring the theatre building to allow for utilization of the site. He questioned the finish on the windows. He also suggested that the blue line below the marquee should be extended past the marquee. He stated there should be some leeway for the signage, considering the original marquee will be retained; however, he felt the marquee on the corner should be considerably smaller and could potentially mimic the shape of the original marquee.

Tim Cruz, Plain Joe Studios, stated the finish on the windows would be copper. The horizontal lines painted on the building to extend past the marquee is easily and is not an issues. He requested additional input on the arch vs. squared design of the windows, and/or any significant changes that might affect the design process.

Chair Rea stated she was not in favor of the initial design proposal. She commented on the architectural design of the corner building and would like to see the corner accentuated. She appreciated the detail on the proposal which captures the upside down "L" and some of the vertical elements of the side of the building. She would like to see the tiles/blocks along with the corner of the building accentuated. She also noted she would like to see the old mural replicated on the blank wall above the marquee. She was in favor of the proposed development and use of the property. Referring to Slide 12: She agreed that the blue strip should be placed on the opposing side of the marquee. She appreciated the design of the vertical windows and the incorporation of replicated features from the exterior design present at City Hall. She also noted that she would like to see the size of the additional marquee reduced. She called the attention to the café being exposed to the elements, and would like to see some options for both opening and closing off the café.

Commissioner Breitenfeld stated she would like to focus on consistency with the original design. She questioned the entrance located on the corner. She felt as though the design of the corner building overwhelmed the original building.

Tim Cruz, Plain Joe Studios, questioned if the design should show and emphasize the existing theater, which was purchased first and the corner building was purchased for incorporated design and visibility. He also indicated the proposed design was inspired to serve the pedestrian level. He stated the theatre and the corner building were being designed to operate as one facility. He also stated the theatre was believed to have the historical significance; thus, the design focused primarily on complementing the architectural design of the theatre.

Senior Planner Paul requested any recommendations for the final design of the project. He stated the project timeline needed to move forward in order to conduct the environmental review and present the project to the Planning Commission.

Principal Planner Finestone requested that the Commission formulate a motion to provide to provide direction to the applicant.

Vice-chair Spann recommended that the design be simplified.

Tim Cruz, Plain Joe Studios, stated the project would need to be reviewed within the next two to three weeks.

Commissioner Correll was in favor of the project, but the overall design consistency was the main concern.

Principal Planner Finestone stated staff would be able to assist with the general overall design; however, broad design changes were of concern and staff would want to bring the item back to the Commission for final review.

Commissioner Purvis requested a copy of the previous Historic Report/Survey. She also recommended the upper story of the new building should be setback and the ornamentation eliminated. She also recommended the pylon be minimized; corner marquee removed; and focus more attention on the design elements that are part of the historic features of the theatre and simplify the design of the corner building. She further stated she liked the color schemes and the details; however, some of the metal work seemed reminiscent of the City Hall rather than the theatre.

Principal Planner Finestone stated that the report/survey would be made available to the Commission.

ACTION:

Chair Rea motioned to defer to staff for project design changes and brought back to the Commission for review. Seconded by Commissioner Correll. Motion passed unanimously.

J.2 DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 14-0047

REQUEST: Proposed Double Garage and Second Story Addition to OEN Residence

LOCATION: 1165 Chestnut Street

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided a brief overview and supplemental documentation for the property. The HPC is tasked with Design Review of the proposed project, but the actual size of the addition may be reduced by further valuation calculations by staff later.

Chair Rea questioned the era of the site and surrounding area. Assistant Planner II Bingham stated that the original structure likely depicted the craftsman style era. Sammuel Mireles, Applicant stated that the existing Mediterranean house was not the original style, he wanted to return it to the craftsman style.

Chair Rea stated that a two story design was concerning, especially if the neighboring backyards are viewable from the second story. She stated that if the neighbors were in agreement with the design, she was in favor of the design.

Vice-chair Spann stated that he liked the plan and that the design was a nice addition to the neighborhood, the project makes the house more conformable.

Commissioner Breitenfeld stated that the existing garage was not usable. She questioned the square footage of the house.

Assistant Planner II Bingham identified the page in the staff report that discussed the square footage of the dwelling.

Chair Rea questioned if the building would have a sprinkler system.

Assistant Planner II Bingham stated that the project presentation was a conceptual design.

ACTION:

Vice-Chair Spann moved to approve staff recommendation for the proposed Double Garage and Second Story Addition to OEN Residence, Commissioner Cowan seconded the motion. Motion passed unanimously.

J.3 DESIGN REVIEW – Case No. ADM 18-0082

REQUEST: Proposed Exterior Modifications to Local Register Garage Associated with its Conversion into an Accessory Dwelling Unit (SDU)

LOCATION: 421 East 4th Avenue

Commissioner Hanwit recused herself due to proximity of her personal residence to the project and stepped down from the dais.

Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II, provided a brief overview and supplemental documentation, including proposed window and door changes that made sense to staff in light of the SDU's floor plan, and requested Commission Approval. Danny Iverson, Applicant Representative, was available for questions.

Chair Rea stated that she would like to see the existing door replaced and suggested that a Dutch door would be charming for the site.

Commissioner Purvis questioned if historic photos were investigated. Assistant Planner II Bingham indicated that the City did not have many photos, he identified the photos that were available.

Chair Rea, understanding that the garage would need to be sealed for habitability, she requested that the design show a resemblance of carriage doors with hinges.

Commissioner Purvis was in favor of the faux carriage door to seal the garage. She questioned the second double hung window. She suggested the possibility of utilizing a skylight. She was in favor of the project, and agreed with staff regarding the doors.

Danny Iverson, Applicant Representative, addressed the design questions.

Vice-chair Spann stated that staff's recommendation for windows was good, he was in favor of the faux carriage door, and was in favor of wood windows.

Chair Rea questioned landscape plans.

Danny Iverson, Applicant Representative, reviewed the site and stated that there was an existing driveway.

Adam Finestone, Principal Planner stated that the plans would still need to be reviewed by the Building Department to ensure compliance with the building code requirements.

ACTION:

Vice-chair Spann moved to approve staff recommendation with the front door being replaced with a period appropriate door, and the placement of a faux door, painted and complete with trim and hinges, for the sealing of the garage. Seconded by Commissioner Correll. Motion carried. Ayes: Rea, Spann, Breitenfeld, Correll, Cowan, and Purvis. Noes: None. Abstained: None. Recused: Hanwit. (6-0-0-1)

J.4 DISCUSSION OF AD HOC WORK GROUPS AND MILLS ACT VISITS

REPORT BY: Adam Finestone

Adam Finestone, Principal Planner, addressed the concerns of the Historic Preservation Commission to continue conducting Mills Act Visits. He stated that after research and review, it had been determined that site visits by the AD HOC Group/Standing Committee would be subject to the Brown Act and would not be suitable for the site inspections. He reviewed staff resources, indicating that the best alternative would be to conduct historical reviews of permit records to determine upgrade requirements. He further stated that staff would continue to review staff resources for the Mills Act Visits.

Commissioner Hanwit stated that the only concerns were that homeowners that are approved for the Mills Act are not required to establish a priority list.

Chair Rea stated that it was unfortunate that the Mills Act Visits would be halted further compromising accountability. She suggested volunteer programs. She questioned the possibility of changing the requirements for the Mills Act. She suggested the requirement for the homeowner to provide pictures showing progress.

Commissioner Breitenfeld stated that if the requirement is not in the contract, then homeowners will not be required to submit photos.

Principal Planner Finestone stated that there were certainly problems with the existing process.

Assistant Planner II Bingham stated that he was provided with information from the 2018 Historic Preservation Conference that other jurisdictions were requiring up to \$6500.00 for a Mills Act application to cover administrative fees. We may want to consider a fee for the Mills Act Visits.

Principal Planner Finestone stated that the fee schedule could potentially be looked at for further background of fee recovery. The item will be up for further discussion.

J.5 REPORT ON MARCH 23, 2018 OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION CONFERENCE

REQUEST: Staff

STAFF SUMMARY: Paul Bingham

ACTION:

Item Tabled for the next regularly scheduled meeting.

J.6 REPORT ON MAY HISTORIC PRESERVATION MONTH ACTIVITIES

REQUEST: Staff

Assistant Planner II Bingham stated that Chair Rea presented a PowerPoint Presentation to the City Council on May 9, 2018, honoring Escondido's Agricultural

Heritage. Three families and one group were honored in the presentation. The families/group: Ben Hillebrecht's Family, Charles Henry's Family, Edward Grangetto's Family, and the Bandy Blacksmith Guild.

Chair Rea stated that the Annual Old Escondido Mother's Day Tour was again a great success and sold 500 tickets.

K. ORAL COMMUNICATION: - None

L. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS: - None

ADJOURNMENT:

The meeting was adjourned at 5:14 PM


Adam Finestone, Principal Planner


Eva Heter, Assistant City Clerk