

## CITY OF ESCONDIDO

### MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

February 14, 2012

The meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:35 p.m. by Chairman McQuead, in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

**Commissioners present:** Commissioner Rea, Commissioner Spann, Commissioner Breitenfeld, Commissioner Lee, Commissioner Christensen, Chairman McQuead, and Vice-chairman Berk.

**Commissioners absent:** None.

**Staff present:** Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner; and Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk.

#### **MINUTES:**

Moved by Commissioner Rea, seconded by Commissioner Spann, to approve the minutes of the October 4, 2011 meeting. Motion carried unanimously.

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.**

**PUBLIC HEARINGS – None.**

#### **CURRENT BUSINESS:**

##### **1. Review of DRB approved addition to historic OEN residence at 421 E. 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue**

Chairman McQuead requested information regarding what the split vote was with the Design Review Board. Mr. Bingham noted that it was a 3-2 vote with one abstention. Commissioner Rea noted that the abstention vote was due to the board member feeling more information was needed.

Commissioner Rea requested clarification regarding the pictures illustrating the cresting.

Byron Wischstadt, applicant, noted that he was in favor of the cresting in order to add elements to the house, especially on the older portions of the house, but he was not sure that the house ever had one.

Mr. Bingham noted that staff did not feel cresting would need to be added if it never existed.

Chairman McQuead noted that the question for the Commission was whether the addition detracted from the style of the original structure.

Commissioner Rea felt the addition overwhelmed what currently existed. She felt the addition resembled a modernized Queen Anne Victorian with turrets, which was not compatible with the original house style. She felt the addition would be a significant change to the structure. She also stated that she would like to see an illustration of how the addition would look from the street.

Commissioner Christensen expressed concern with the mass and scale of the addition not being compatible with the original structure.

Commissioner Berk provided some background history for the property, noting that one of the owners started the "Times Advocate" newspaper. She expressed concern with adding cresting and the scale and mass of the addition. She felt that the size of the proposed addition would be appropriate without the pop-outs and overhangs. She also felt the existing porch with the brick columns were out of character with what originally existed and the neighborhood. She then presented a sketch she had drawn of the porch and suggested using it as a possible model.

Mr. Bingham noted his understanding that the Commission had in a past hearing objected to the idea of removing the 1933 Craftsman front porch and restoring the original.

Commissioner Rea asked when the brick columns were put on. Mr. Wischstadt stated that he did not have this information.

Samuel B. Wright, Architect, suggested going back to something more original for the porch.

Mr. Wischstadt noted that he was more than willing to reduce the pop-outs and reduce the height of the addition.

Mr. Bingham noted that the concept was to remove the 1970s addition and retain the underlying original wall. Mr. Wischstadt noted that they wanted to gain access to the attic for storage.

Commissioner Lee expressed concern with the pop-outs.

Commissioner Breitenfeld expressed concern with the mass and scale of the addition detracting from the original house. She also felt the existing porch needed to be reworked back to what originally existed.

Commissioner Spann was opposed to the design of the front porch. He then asked Mr. Wischstadt if he planned on installing double-hung windows. Mr. Wischstadt replied in the affirmative. He also stated that he was in favor of the proposed paint scheme.

Commissioner Breitenfeld asked if the siding would match. Mr. Wischstadt replied in the affirmative and noted that they would blend the original with the new.

Commissioner Spann suggested planting trees in the front yard. Mr. Wischstadt concurred.

Commissioner Rea was opposed to the brick columns on the front porch and suggested changing it back to what originally existed.

Commissioner Rea noted that the addition would cast a significant shadow on the neighbor's house. Mr. Bingham noted that he had spoken with the neighbor and invited her to come or to write something in favor or against the project, noting he had not received any comments.

Commissioner Berk requested that the porch be redesigned to be more appropriate and that the original house be more visible.

#### **ACTION:**

Moved by Chairman McQuead, seconded by Commissioner Spann, to request staff to work with the applicant to reduce the mass of the rear addition, rework the front porch, and differentiate the design between the original and new architecture. Motion carried. Ayes: Lee, Christensen, Berk, Breitenfeld, Spann, and McQuead. Noes: Rea. (6-1)

#### **2. New General Plan Draft & how it relates to Historic Preservation Commissions**

Jay Petrek, Principal Planner, provided the General Plan draft and requested input.

Discussion ensued regarding clustering policies.

Commissioner Rea noted issues with traffic in Old Escondido Neighborhood and asked if anything could be done. Mr. Petrek noted that this would be better addressed in the area plan.

Commissioner Rea expressed concern with allowing excessive heights in the downtown area, noting her concern with impacts to the Old Escondido Neighborhood. Mr. Petrek referenced the proposed height limits for downtown.

Commissioner Berk asked what the height limits were for Escondido Boulevard. Mr. Petrek noted he could check into this and report back to the Commission.

Commissioner Berk noted her concern with the width of the sidewalk near the Paramount being limited. Mr. Petrek noted that the downtown specific plan had zero setbacks and what is being proposed now is building setbacks from the edge of curb being no less than 14 feet.

### **3. Discussion regarding the use of “story poles”**

Commissioner Berk questioned whether the City used story poles.

Mrs. Cherry noted that Escondido did not use story poles but noted that the City did have the ability to request story poles for projects. She noted that they might be helpful for large scale historic projects.

### **4. Summary of CLG Annual Report**

Mr. Bingham referenced draft report and requested input.

Chairman McQuead referenced Page 9, Item 1 not being checked and Item E. Commissioner Berk felt the report was a great reminder of what the Commission was to accomplish each year. Commissioner Rea referenced Section I on Page 13 and suggested checking “yes” for holding a workshop. Commissioner Berk felt more training on context for surveys was needed.

### **5. OHP Review & Approval of Council Changes to Article 40 & 65**

Mrs. Cherry referenced the confirmation letter from OHP and requested input. No discussion.

### **6. Discussion of 2012 CLG Grant (applications are due in April)**

Chairman McQuead noted he would email staff when they would be meeting.

### **7. Consideration of supporting the Old Escondido Historic District board’s nomination for the SOHO “People in Preservation” award**

Commissioner Berk noted that Carol Rea had been nominated by the Old Escondido Historic District Board for the SOHO award and suggested supporting the nomination.

**ACTION:**

Moved by Commissioner Berk, seconded by Commissioner Christensen, to support the Old Escondido Historic District Board's nomination of Carol Rea. Motion carried. Ayes: Spann, Breitenfeld, Lee, Christensen, McQuead, and Berk. Noes: None. Abstained: Rea. (6-0-1)

**SUBCOMMITTEE UPDATES:**

Historic District – Breitenfeld, Rea  
History Center – Lee  
CLG Grant – Breitenfeld, Christensen, McQuead  
Commercial Historical Liaison – Spann  
Design Review Board – Rea  
Register/Survey – Berk, Christensen, and Breitenfeld. (Alternate: McQuead)  
Daley Ranch – Lee, McQuead  
Mills Act Monitoring Committee – Berk, Breitenfeld, Rea and Spann  
Historic Public Relations – Berk, Rea, and Christensen  
Endangered Structures/Vintage Signs – Commissioner Rea and Commissioner Berk

*The Design Review update should be deleted from next agenda.*

The Commission and staff provided updates to each other.

**Nomination for Historic Awards Program**

Adaptive-Reuse Award  
Best Appearance Award  
Historic Research Award  
Historic Rehabilitation Award  
Historic Preservation Award  
Historic Restoration Award  
Historic Reconstruction Award  
Landscaping Award  
Mayor's Award  
Special Merit Award

Commissioner Rea suggested adding a commercial award to the nomination category, noting May was preservation month which might be a good opportunity to do a workshop with City Council regarding the economic benefits of historic

preservation with the focus being on commercial projects. She stated that she would coordinate putting together a PowerPoint presentation.

Commissioner Rea noted she would email some potential nominations to staff.

Mr. Bingham noted he would provide the City's FTP site information where photos could be uploaded.

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS – None.**

**COMMISSIONER COMMENTS – None.**

**WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS:**

1. Exhibits for 421 E. 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue proposed addition (Item G.1).
2. Copy of draft CLG Annual Report to review (Item G.4)
3. Copy of letter from the Office of Historic Preservation (Item G.6)
4. CLG Application (Item G.7).
5. Email regarding SOHO award (Item G.8).
6. Memo regarding nominations for HPC awards (Item I).

**ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting was adjourned at 4:49 p.m. The next meeting was scheduled for April 17, 2012 at 3:30 p.m.

---

Rozanne Cherry, Principal Planner

---

Ty Paulson, Minutes Clerk