CITY OF ESCONDIDO
Historic Preservation Commission and Staff Seating

CAROL REA
Chair

JAMES SPANN
Commissioner

CAROL BREITENFELD
Commissioner

MARC CORRELL
Commissioner

ERROL COWAN
Vice-Chair

MARION HANLON
Commissioner

NICOLE PURVIS
Commissioner

JOANNE TASHER
Minutes Clerk

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
201 N. Broadway
City Hall Council Chambers

VIRTUAL MEETING AT 3:00 P.M.
March 18, 2021

A. CALL TO ORDER
B. FLAG SALUTE
C. ROLL CALL
D. REVIEW OF SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES: February 25, 2021

The Brown Act provides an opportunity for members of the public to directly address the Commission on any item of interest to the public, before or during the Commission's consideration of the item. If you wish to speak regarding an agenda item, please fill out a speaker's slip and give it to the minutes clerk who will forward it to the Chairman.

Pursuant to Governor Newsom’s Executive Orders, including N-25-20 and N-29-20: Certain Brown Act requirements for the holding of a public meeting have been temporarily suspended and members of the Historic Preservation Commission and staff will participate in this meeting via teleconference. In the interest of reducing the spread of COVID-19, members of the public are encouraged to submit their agenda and non-agenda comments online at the following link https://www.escondido.org/public-comment-form.aspx. Council Chambers will be closed, no public allowed.

Public Comment: To submit comments in writing, please do so at the following link: https://www.escondido.org/public-comment-form.aspx. If you would like to have the comment read out loud at the meeting (not to exceed three minutes), please write “Read Out Loud” in the subject line. All comments received from the public will be made a part of the record of the meeting. The meeting will be available for viewing via public television on Cox Communications Channel 19 and AT&T U-verse Channel 99 (Escondido only). The meeting will also be live streamed online at the following link: https://www.escondido.org/ and click on the graphic showing “live stream - meeting in progress”.

To watch the archived Historic Preservation Commission meeting(s) please visit: https://escondido.12milesout.com/presentations/boards-and-commissions-and-state-of-the-city-videos

Availability of supplemental materials after agenda posting: Any supplemental writings or documents provided to the Historic Preservation Commission regarding any item on this agenda will be made available for public inspection in the Planning Division located at 201 N. Broadway during normal business hours, or in the Council Chambers while the meeting is in session.

The City of Escondido recognizes its obligation to provide equal access to public services to individuals with disabilities. Please contact the A.D.A. Coordinator, (760) 839-4643, with any requests for reasonable accommodation, at least 24 hours prior to the meeting.
E. WRITTEN COMMUNICATION:

"Under State law, all items under Written Communications can have no action and will be referred to the staff for administrative action or scheduled on a subsequent agenda."

F. ORAL COMMUNICATION:

"Under State law, all items under Oral Communications can have no action and will be referred to the staff for administrative action or scheduled on a subsequent agenda." This is the opportunity for members of the public to address the Commission on any item of business within the jurisdiction of the Commission.

G. PUBLIC HEARINGS: None

H. CURRENT BUSINESS:

1. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. PL 21-0055:

REQUEST: Grand Avenue Vision Plan – Phase I HPC guidance in selection of place-making features proposed for the Grand Avenue Vision Plan (Phase I), including ornamental lighting fixtures, fencing and sidewalk treatments

ZONING/LOCATION: Downtown Specific Plan, Downtown Historic District / Grand Avenue between Maple Street and Broadway

APPLICANT: City of Escondido

STAFF: Julie Procopio, Director of Engineering Services/City Engineer

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

2. DISCUSSION – 2021 HISTORIC PRESERVATION AWARDS:

REQUEST: Follow up discussion on potential themes and/or recipients for 2021 Historic Preservation awards

STAFF: Paul K. Bingham, Assistant Planner II

Note: Current Business items are those that under state law and local ordinances do not require either public notice or public hearings. Public comments may be limited to a maximum time of three minutes per person.

I. ORAL COMMUNICATION:

"Under State law, all items under Oral Communication can have no action, and will be referred to the staff for administrative action or scheduled on a subsequent agenda." This is the opportunity for members of the public to address the commission on any item of business within the jurisdiction of the Commission.

J. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

K. ADJOURNMENT TO NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED MEETING ON MAY 20, 2021
CITY OF ESCONDIDO

ACTION MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
ESCONDIDO HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

February 25, 2021

The regular meeting of the Historic Preservation Commission was called to order at 3:02 p.m. by Chair Rea in Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

Commissioners present: Carol Rea, Chair; Errol Cowan, Vice-Chair; Marc Correll*, Commissioner; James Spann, Commissioner; Marion Hanlon, Commissioner; and Nicole Purvis, Commissioner.

*Note: Only attended part of the meeting due to internet connectivity issues.

Commissioners absent: Carol Breitenfeld, Commissioner.

Staff present: Adam Finestone, City Planner; Julie Procopio, Director of Engineering Services; Jay Paul, Senior Planner; Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II; Grant Ruroede, Assistant Planner I; Jessica Relucio, Assistant Planner I; and Joanne Tasher, Minutes Clerk.

MINUTES:

Moved by Commissioner *Correll, with the correction to the November 19, 2020, Minutes that the Vice-Chair is Erroll Cowan, not James Spann; seconded by Vice-Chair Cowan, to approve the action minutes of the November 19, 2020, meeting. Motion carried unanimously (6-0-0; Breitenfeld was absent).

*Note: Just after roll call, Commissioner Correll experienced internet connection issues. He lost connection to the live-stream meeting and was not able to rejoin the meeting.

WRITTEN COMMUNICATION: None.

ORAL COMMUNICATION: None.
PUBLIC HEARINGS: None.

CURRENT BUSINESS:

1. DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NO. PL 21-0055:

REQUEST: Grand Avenue Vision Plan – Phase I Historic Preservation Commission guidance in selection of place-making features proposed for the Grand Avenue Vision Plan (Phase I), including ornamental lighting fixtures, fencing and sidewalk treatments

ZONING/LOCATION: Downtown Specific Plan, Downtown Historic District / Grand Avenue between Maple Street and Broadway

APPLICANT: City of Escondido

STAFF: Julie Procopio, Director of Engineering Services/City Engineer

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Provide direction

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners discussed the three design elements of the Grand Avenue Vision Plan. They discussed each design element - lighting, fencing, and sidewalks separately.

Lighting

The Commissioners raised concerns with the design and style of the proposed lighting, related to both the height of the poles and the style of the lights themselves, and felt that the design is inappropriate for the historic area.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis, seconded by Chair Rea for the applicant to research additional lighting options (single acorn style) that are more in line with the historic feeling of Downtown. Motion passed unanimously (5-0-0; Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).
Fencing

There were three styles of fencing presented: Standard Ameristar Fence, “Thicket” and custom cutout.

The “Thicket” style is recommended by the applicant since it is decorative and is reasonably priced.

The Commissioners felt the plain style – Standard Ameristar Fence is more in line with the historic downtown.

COMMISSIONER ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis and seconded by Commissioner Cowan to recommend the Standard Ameristar Fence design. Motion passed unanimously (5-0-0; Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

Sidewalks

Two different design/color palettes were presented. The Commissioners debated the color of the sidewalk, “platinum” and beige vs. gray; landscaping, and the idea of adding script or a spiral design laser etched into the concrete.

COMMISSIONER ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis and seconded by Vice-Chair Cowan to recommend a single “platinum” color pavement with consistent score lines. Motion passed 5-0-0 (Commissioners Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

No action was taken regarding the type of text, font, or lettering to be etched into the sidewalk. Rather, the Commission directed staff to return with more information on this issue.
2. **DESIGN REVIEW – CASE NOS. SUB 19-0010 AND PHG 19-0050:**

REQUEST: Hacienda de Vega condo project - Historic design element

ZONING/LOCATION: South Centre City Specific Plan, Southern Entry District 2608 S. Escondido Boulevard

APPLICANT: South Escondido L.P. / (Kitchell Development Co.)

STAFF: Jay Paul, Senior Planner

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

**COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:**

The Commissioners discussed various aspects of the historic design element proposed by the applicant and provided suggestions for what might be a more appropriate design. Amongst other things, the Commission asked the applicant to utilize the adobe bricks from the original Paxton house as part of an entryway into the development.

**COMMISSIONER ACTION:**

The Commission directed the applicant to make revisions to the proposed design element, and to return for consideration at a later date.

3. **DESIGN REVIEW– CASE NO. PL 21-0078:**

REQUEST: Detached pavilion on a local register property located outside of a historic district

ZONING/LOCATION: RE-20 (Residential Estates, min. lot size 20,000 SF) / 538 S. Citrus Avenue

APPLICANT: Dennis Ortman

STAFF: Grant Ruroede, Assistant Planner I

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval
COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners discussed the project.

COMMISSIONER ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Spann and seconded by Commissioner Purvis, to approve the application as presented by staff. Motion carried unanimously (5-0-0 Commissioners Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).

4. DESIGN REVIEW– CASE NO. PL 20-0612:

REQUEST: Room addition on the front of a single-family home in the Old Escondido Neighborhood

ZONING/LOCATION: R-1-6 (Single-family residential, min. lot size 6,000 SF) / 334 E. Ninth Ave.

APPLICANT: Mitch Mitchell, Residential Designs

STAFF: Jessica Relucio, Assistant Planner I

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Approval

COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners discussed various aspects of the project. They expressed dissatisfaction with the proposed modifications, and encouraged the applicant to consider requesting that the house be listed on the local register and potentially be able to enter into a Mills Act contract.

COMMISSION ACTION:

Moved by Commissioner Purvis and seconded by Chair Rea to deny staff recommendation and not approve the proposed project. Motion carried unanimously 5-0-0 (Commissioners Breitenfeld and Correll were absent).
5. **INFORMATION ITEM – REVIEW OF PREVIOUS AGENDA ITEMS:**

   REQUEST: None (informational item only)

   STAFF: Adam Finestone, Principal Planner

   **COMMISSION ACTION:**

   No action taken, discussion only.

6. **DISCUSSION – ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW PROCEDURES:**

   REQUEST: Establish an ad-hoc subcommittee to address environmental review procedures

   STAFF: Adam Finestone, City Planner

   **COMMISSION ACTION:**

   Chair Rea, Vice-Chair Cowan and Commissioner Purvis volunteered for the committee.

7. **DISCUSSION – ACCESSORY DWELLING UNITS:**

   REQUEST: Establish an ad-hoc subcommittee to identify objective design criteria for Accessory Dwelling Units on historic properties

   STAFF: Adam Finestone, City Planner

   **COMMISSION ACTION:**

   Commissioners Hanlon, Purvis and Spann volunteered for the committee.
8. **DISCUSSION – 2021 HISTORIC PRESERVATION AWARDS:**

**REQUEST:** Discuss potential themes and/or recipients for 2021 Historic Preservation awards

**STAFF:** Paul K. Bingham, Assistant Planner II

**COMMISSION DISCUSSION:**

The Commissioners agreed they will focus this year on Escondido’s places of assembly. The list of buildings to select from includes The 1st United Methodist Church of Escondido at 341 S. Kalmia St., The Canvas Church (Old Vintage Church) at 1300 S. Juniper St., The Trinity Episcopal Church at 845 Chestnut St., The First Church of Christ Scientist at 440 S. Broadway, The Point Church (formerly Iglesia Monte de Los Olivos) at 331 W. 4th Ave., and The Escondido Masonic Center (Consuelo Masonic Lodge #325, an adobe) at 1331 S. Escondido Blvd.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The Commissioners will decide the potential recipients at the next HPC meeting on 3/18/21.

**ORAL COMMUNICATION:** None.

**COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:**

Commissioner Purvis happily announced that Chair Rea published a new book!

**ADJOURNMENT:**

The meeting was adjourned at 6:09 p.m. to the next regularly scheduled Historic Preservation Commission Meeting on March 18, 2021.

______________________________  _______________________
Adam Finestone, Secretary to the  Joanne Tasher, Minutes Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission
TO: Historic Preservation Commission

FROM: Julie Procopio, Director of Engineering Services/City Engineer

PROJECT: PL 21-0055, Grand Avenue Vision Plan – Phase I

LOCATION: Grand Avenue between Escondido Boulevard and Juniper Street

APPLICANT: City of Escondido

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The project aims to revitalize Grand Avenue between Escondido Boulevard and Juniper Street by enhancing the pedestrian experience through narrower traffic lanes, wider sidewalks and place-making features. The project is the first phase of a multi-phase Vision Plan established for Grand Avenue.

Project features include:

- Narrowing Grand Avenue to one lane in each direction and adding diagonal parking to at least one side of the street between Escondido Boulevard and Juniper Street.

- Replacing and widening the sidewalk on the north side of the street between Maple Street and Broadway and expanding outdoor dining area fencing. Historic tiled entry areas are to be preserved (see Exhibit 1). Existing trees are also to be preserved, to the extent feasible, and one tree is to be added.

- Removal of medians between Maple Street and Kalmia Street, and installation of ornamental street and festoon lighting.

- Realignment of North County Transit District (NCTD) Breeze bus routes 351 and 352 from Grand Avenue to nearby Second Avenue and Valley Parkway, respectively. Two new bus shelters and benches meeting NCTD standards are to be installed at existing bus stops along Second Avenue and Valley Parkway.

DESIGN REVIEW: The Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) reviewed this project at its February 25, 2021 and asked staff to return with an alternate single acorn light fixture and alternate sidewalk etching design.
DISCUSSION:

**Ornamental Street Lighting:** Between Maple Street and Kalmia Street, the project replaces the existing 60-Watt pedestrian scale Acorn light fixtures with taller, light fixtures that would light both the street and the sidewalk. The new fixtures would also serve as a mounting point for the festoon lighting, as well as banners and hanging baskets. To comply with Dark Sky guidelines, fixtures must include a top. The following options for light fixtures are provided:

1. The Double-Acorn style fixtures (60 Watts each).
2. Single Acorn light fixture (100 Watts each).

**Sidewalk Etching:** The existing sidewalk on the north side of Grand Avenue between Maple Street and Broadway is to be replaced and widened by five feet. While outdoor dining will be encouraged on the interior portion of the sidewalk, the expanded sidewalk area on the outside of the tree wells is intended to be free from permanent obstructions to support pedestrian activity and provide additional capacity for the numerous events held on Grand Avenue.

Two options are provided for sidewalk etching/engraving:
1. Spiral etching is proposed that weaves between the trees mirroring the circular pattern of the tree wells.
2. Paragraph-style etching is also provided as an option at the request of the HPC.

Staff will incorporate the recommendations of the HPC into the final design in April. Bid and award of the contract is anticipated to follow shortly thereafter with construction beginning in the summer of 2021.

Respectfully Submitted,

*Julie Procopio*

Julie Procopio, PE  
Director of Engineering Services/City Engineer

Exhibits:
Exhibit A: Light Fixture Options  
Exhibit B: Sidewalk Etching Options
Exhibit B
Sidewalk Lettering
PL 21-0055

Option 1: Spiral Etching

Option 2: Paragraph Style Etching

Lettering:
Size: ½” to ¾”
Style: Cambria or TIMES ROMAN
TO: Historic Preservation Commission  
FROM: Paul Bingham, Assistant Planner II  
SUBJECT: Nominations for this Year’s Historic Preservation Awards  

DESCRIPTION:

Traditionally the City of Escondido recognizes deserving individuals, groups and properties each year for their historic preservation contributions. The Historic Preservation Commission selects nominees who are presented with Historic Preservation awards by the Mayor and City Council in May.

These awards have often revolved around a theme, such as honoring our agricultural heritage, adobe structures, iconic signs, and commercial facades, amongst others. However, it is not required that a theme be specified. The awards can simply honor specific cases of historic preservation work.

At our recent Special Meeting held on February 25, 2021, the Commission agreed to focus this year on Escondido’s places of assembly. The Commission provided Staff with a list of buildings they wish to select from, which includes:

(A) The 1st United Methodist Church of Escondido at 341 S. Kalmia Street  
(B) The Canvas Church (Old Vintage Church) at 1300 S. Juniper Street  
(C) The Trinity Episcopal Church at 845 Chestnut Street  
(D) The First Church of Christ Scientist at 440 S. Broadway  
(E) The Point Church (formerly Iglesia Monte de Los Olivos) at 331 W. 4th Avenue  
(F) The Escondido Masonic Center (Consuelo Masonic Lodge #325, an adobe) at 1331 S. Escondido Blvd.

It is requested that the Commission consider these six places of assembly and chose three to be awarded Historic Preservation Awards for 2021, to be presented by the Mayor at a City Council meeting in May, 2021, in conjunction with National Historic Preservation Month. Photographs of the six properties are attached as Exhibit A.
EXHIBIT A
Item H.2

The Commission provided Staff with a list of buildings they wish to select from, which includes:

(A) The 1st United Methodist Church of Escondido at 341 S. Kalmia Street

(B) The Canvas Church (Old Vintage Church) at 1300 S. Juniper Street
(C) The Trinity Episcopal Church at 845 Chestnut Street

(D) The First Church of Christ Scientist at 440 S. Broadway
(E) The Point Church (formerly Iglesia Monte de Los Olivos) at 331 W. 4th Avenue

(F) The Escondido Masonic Center (Consuelo Masonic Lodge #325, an adobe) at 1331 S. Escondido Blvd.