# CITY OF ESCONDIDO

# Planning Commission and Staff Seating



A. CALL TO ORDER: 7 p.m.

**B. FLAG SALUTE** 

C. ROLL CALL:

D. MINUTES: 05/25/21

The Brown Act provides an opportunity for members of the public to directly address the Planning Commission on any item of interest to the public before or during the Planning Commission's consideration of the item. If you wish to speak regarding an agenda item, please fill out a speaker's slip and give it to the minutes clerk who will forward it to the chairman.

**Electronic Media:** Electronic media that members of the public want to be used during any public comment period should be submitted to the Planning Division at least 24 hours prior to the meeting.

The electronic media will be subject to a virus scan and must be compatible with the City's existing system. The media must be labeled with the applicable agenda item and the name and contact information of the person presenting the media.

The time used to present any electronic media will be considered as part of the maximum time limit provided to speakers. City staff will queue the electronic information when the applicable speaker is called upon to speak. Materials shown to the Commission during the meeting are part of the public record and will be retained by the City.

The City of Escondido is not responsible for the content of any material presented, and the presentation and content of electronic media shall be subject to the same protocol regarding decorum and presentation as are applicable to live presentations.

If you wish to speak concerning an item not on the agenda, you may do so during the designated time for "Oral Communications." All persons addressing the Planning Commission are asked to state their names for the public record.

**Availability of supplemental materials after agenda posting:** Any supplemental writings or documents provided to the Planning Commission regarding any item on this agenda will be made available for public inspection in the Planning Division located at 201 N. Broadway during normal business hours, or in the Council Chambers while the meeting is in session.

The City of Escondido recognizes its obligation to provide equal access to public services for individuals with disabilities. Please contact the ADA Coordinator at 760-839-4643 with any requests for reasonable accommodation at least 24 hours prior to the meeting.

#### E. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS:

Under state law, all items under Written Communications can have no action, and will be referred to the staff for administrative action or scheduled on a subsequent agenda.

#### 1. Future Neighborhood Meetings

#### F. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:

Under state law, all items under Oral Communications can have no action, and may be referred to the staff for administrative action or scheduled on a subsequent agenda.

This is the opportunity for members of the public to address the Commission on any item of business within the jurisdiction of the Commission.

#### G. PUBLIC HEARINGS:

Please try to limit your testimony to three minutes.

None.

#### H. CURRENT BUSINESS:

Note: Current Business items are those that under state law and local ordinances do not require either public notice or public hearings. Public comments will be limited to a maximum time of three minutes per person.

#### 1. CIP General Plan Consistency Analysis

Staff will provide an informational report and ask the Commission to decide that the Fiscal Years 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget is in conformance with the City of Escondido General Plan.

# 2. Housing and Community Investment Study (HCIS)

Staff will provide an informational report and status update to the Commission.

# 3. Discussion on the scope of a "Green Infrastructure Plan"

#### I. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:

Under state law, all items under Oral Communications can have no action and may be referred to staff for administrative action or scheduled on a subsequent agenda.

This is the opportunity for members of the public to address the Commission on any item of business within the jurisdiction of the Commission.

#### J. PLANNING COMMISSIONERS

#### **K. ADJOURNMENT**

#### CITY OF ESCONDIDO

# ACTION MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE ESCONDIDO PLANNING COMMISSION VIDEO/VIRTUAL CONFERENCE

# May 25, 2021

The meeting of the Escondido Planning Commission was called to order at 7 p.m. by Chair Barba, in the City Council Chambers, 201 North Broadway, Escondido, California.

**Commissioners present:** Katharine Barba, Chair; Ingrid Rainey, Vice-Chair; Dao Doan, Commissioner; Rick Paul, Commissioner; Herminia Ramirez, Commissioner; Nathan Serrato, Commissioner; and Stan Weiler, Commissioner.

Commissioners absent: None.

**Staff present:** Mike Strong, Director of Community Development; Elyse Dayrit, Deputy City Attorney I; Owen Tunnell, Assistant City Engineer; Craig Williams, Associate Engineer; and Joanne Tasher, Minutes Clerk.

#### MINUTES:

Moved by Commissioner Weiler, seconded by Vice-Chair Rainey to approve the Action Minutes of the April 27, 2021, Planning Commission meeting. Motion carried unanimously (7-0). Ayes: Barba, Doan, Paul, Rainey, Ramirez, Serrato, and Weiler.

# WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS: Received.

Communication from Laura Hunter, Chair, Sierra Club North County Group, dated May 24, 2021, regarding the designation of the City of Escondido's surplus land was submitted into the record.

FUTURE NEIGHBORHOOD MEETINGS: None.

**ORAL COMMUNICATIONS:** Received.

Communication from Laura Hunter, Chair, Sierra Club North County Group, dated May 25, 2021, regarding the City of Escondido's surplus land, was read into the record.

# **PUBLIC HEARINGS:**

# 1. PUBLIC NUISANCE APPEAL CASE NO. C 20-4286:

Request: An appeal of a notice and order to abate a public nuisance requiring the abatement of weeds and hazardous vegetation.

Location: 400 James Street (APN: 231-140-2000)

Staff Recommendation: Deny the appeal and uphold the Building Official's decision

#### **COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:**

The Commissioners discussed various aspects of this issue and came the conclusion that the property owner had sufficient time, over six months, to correct the Code Enforcement violations and provide proper weed abatement and clean up his property.

PUBLIC SPEAKERS (Submitted written comments, read aloud for the record):

**Josephine Vinson**, spoke in favor of the City upholding the public nuisance.

## **COMMISSION ACTION:**

Motion by Vice-Chair Rainey to support City Option C and seconded by Commissioner Serrato to deny the appeal and uphold the public nuisance and notice to abate. Motion Approved 5-2; Ayes: Barba, Rainey, Ramirez, Serrato and Weiler. Noes: Doan and Paul.

# **CURRENT BUSINESS:**

# 1. <u>Traffic Impact Analysis Guidelines and VMT Significance Thresholds</u>

Craig Williams, Associate Engineer, presented information regarding the City's updated Traffic Impact Analysis Guidelines and VMT significance thresholds.

#### COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners thanked Mr. Williams for his presentation and held a brief discussion.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

No action was taken; information was presented and discussed.

# 2. Commission Annual Work Plan

Adopt the Commission's two-year Work Plan

#### COMMISSION DISCUSSION:

The Commissioners thanked Director Strong for his efforts in creating the Work Plan.

Commissioner Paul asked if Chair Barba could bring a framework of a Green Infrastructure Plan to the next Planning Commission meeting for the Commission to review.

Commissioner Weiler reiterated his objection to a new Green Infrastructure Plan on the basis that it is a burden to City Staff and unnecessary to create an entire new plan, and that instead it can be rolled into the General Plan or Climate Action Plan.

#### COMMISSION ACTION:

Motion by Commissioner Paul and seconded by Vice-Chair Rainey to approve the Annual Work Plan. Approved 6-1; Ayes: Barba, Doan, Paul Rainey, Ramirez, and Serrato. Noes: Weiler.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS: None.	
PLANNING COMMISSIONERS:	
Chair Barba completed ethics training; it took two hou	rs to complete.
ADJOURNMENT:	
Chair Barba adjourned the meeting at 9:05 p.m.	
Mike Strong, Secretary to the Escondido Planning Commission	e Tasher, Minutes Clerk



# PLANNING COMMISSION

Agenda Item No.: <u>H.1</u> Date: June 8, 2021

INCOLCINONDLIA NANL. CII GLINLIALI LAN CONSISTLINCI ANALTSI	PROJECT NUMBER / NAME: C	IP GENERAL PL/	AN CONSISTENCY	<b>ANALYSIS</b>
---	--------------------------	----------------	----------------	-----------------

**REQUEST:** Determine that the Fiscal Years 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget is in conformance with the City of Escondido General Plan

**LOCATION:** CityWide

APN / APNS: N/A

**GENERAL PLAN / ZONING: N/A** 

APPLICANT: C

Community Development

Department

PRIMARY REPRESENTATIVE:

Mike Strong, Director of Community

Development

**DISCRETIONARY ACTIONS REQUESTED: N/A** 

PREVIOUS ACTIONS: None.

PROJECT PLANNER: Mike Strong, Director of Community Development

mstrong@escondido.org

CEQA RECOMMENDATION: The proposed action is not a "Project" as defined in section 15378 of

the CEQA Guidelines

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION:** Determine that the CIP Program and Budget is in conformance with

the General Plan

**REQUESTED ACTION:** Approve Planning Commission Resolution No. 2021-09

**CITY COUNCIL HEARING REQUIRED**: ☐ YES ☒ NO

REPORT APPROVALS: 

Mike Strong, Community Development Director

☐ Adam Finestone, City Planner

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

# A. BACKGROUND:

The City's current Capital Improvement Program ("CIP") program sets out a long-term capital improvement and activities program budget for the City. The Five-Year CIP document identifies both funding sources and capital projects to be funded each year for the next five fiscal years (FY 2021/22 to 2024/25). Most resources available for capital projects are restricted as to permissible uses in one fashion or another. Thus, the CIP is largely a product of matching community needs with such resources, taking into account City Council policy objectives to the extent possible. Per Council policy, the Planning Commission generally does not have authority over a CIP project or its budget. Rather, this is a request for the Planning Commission to review the FY 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget and find that it is consistent with the General Plan. Each Fiscal Year, the City Council adopts an update of the CIP through the budget process. The CIP Program and Budget identifies proposed capital improvements and activities that often occur over multiple years. This includes construction projects and purchases of land, equipment, and contract services. The projects are included based on City Council direction and recommendations from staff experts of various disciplines.

State law requires a City's planning agency to review and report on the consistency of the CIP with the General Plan (Government Code sections 65103(c), 65401). This is one of the Planning Commission's duties at the City of Escondido. The scope of the Commission's review is limited to determining if CIP projects are consistent with the General Plan. It is the Council's role and discretion to review and direct the scope, phasing, and cost of capital projects; therefore, discussion of this item should be focused on whether projects are consistent with particular General Plan goals and policies. The Commission's comments and findings will be forwarded to the City Council for consideration at its meeting for budget adoption. Following CIP adoption, engineering staff processes capital projects through a separate approval process with the City Council prior to construction.

#### B. SUMMARY OF REQUEST:

Sections 65401 and 65402 of the California Government Code require that a local agency's CIP be in conformance with the General Plan. State law also mandates that this determination of conformance be made by a designated planning agency. For the City of Escondido, the designated planning agency is the Planning Commission. The purpose of this staff report is to present the CIP projects for FY 2021/22 to 2024/25 so the Commission can make a determination of consistency with the adopted General Plan.

#### C. SUPPLEMENTAL DETAILS OF REQUEST:

The principal tools used to guide planning and programming of public infrastructure improvements is the City's General Plan and CIP. The General Plan contains numerous goals and policies that provide direction in addressing the City's short and long-term infrastructure needs. The CIP Program and Budget prioritizes and sets funding for improvement projects. The proposed capital improvements and activities are a critical tool for the orderly physical development of a city or county. The recommendations of a CIP can be utilized to strengthen the linkage between General Plan implementation and capital improvement expenditures. The proposed CIP Program and

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

Budget for FY 2021/22 to 2024/25 includes 244 projects into 11 categories (16 projects in Community Services, three projects in Economic Development, 23 projects in General City, 11 projects in Library, 28 projects in Parks and Recreation, seven projects in Art, 33 projects in Public Safety, 12 projects in Public Works, 60 projects in Streets, 33 projects in Wastewater Utilities, and 18 projects in Water Utilities). Information on the projects is provided in the actual CIP Program and Budget document (provided in Attachment 1), which lists projects by name and type, including a project description, cost estimate, and other details. The Program Summary outlines the existing projects in the City's CIP as well as the ones that are requesting new or additional funding.

Staff has reviewed the proposed projects for the 2021-2022 to 2024/25 fiscal years and determined that the projects are consistent with the General Plan. The determination of consistency from the Planning Commission is needed prior to the City Council's adoption of the CIP as part of the budget process. The City Council will use the Planning Commission's determination for this purpose.

## D. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

General Plan conformity can be best described as CIP projects furthering the achievement of the goals, policies, and infrastructure in the General Plan. For example, the construction of a particular roadway identified in the General Plan would be considered consistent if the roadway is depicted on the Circulation Element map, identified in the goals and policies, and/or listed as an implementation program/activity. The CIP Program improvement projects have been categorized by function and type. (Attachment 1 includes the list of capital improvement projects and activities for the five-year CIP by category.) Table 1 below identifies the corresponding General Plan Element for each CIP category. The general scope for each category includes associated activities pertaining to planning, environmental, engineering, design, right of way acquisition, preparation of construction documents, advertisement for construction bids, construction and administrative/management tasks.

**Table 1: CIP Categories and Related General Plan Elements** 

CIP Category	General Scope of CIP Category	Applicable General Plan			
		Element			
Community Services	Housing programs and services and	Chapter IV: Housing Element			
	neighborhood community programs				
Economic	Developing and guiding employment	Chapter IX: Economic			
Development	and business opportunities and Prosperity				
	encouraging appropriate economic and				
	business development in the city				
General City	All purpose and administration	All Elements and Chapter X:			
		Implementation			
Library	Expanding collection stock and	Chapter V: Community Health			
	staffing; providing additional space for	and Services			
	computers; group study and parking;				
	and continuing to expand the role of				

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

		T		
	technology in providing library services			
	and resources			
Parks and	Park Land Acquisition and Park	Chapter V: Community Health		
Recreation	Improvements to existing parks or	and Services		
	future master planned parks			
Art	public art displays and the performing	Chapter V: Community Health		
	arts	and Services		
Public Safety	Fire and police protection; emergency	Chapter VI: Community		
	preparedness, disaster response, and	Protection		
	recovery; and code enforcement	1 Totodion		
	activities to proactively address threats			
D 11: 14/ 1	to life and property			
Public Works	Remove, replace, repair public works	Chapter III: Mobility and		
	facilities within the public right of way	Infrastructure		
	including paving, curb and gutter,			
	sidewalk, ramps, signing, striping,			
	drainage			
Streets	Road and intersection improvements	Chapter III: Mobility and		
	based on standard plans and/or	Infrastructure		
	engineered design including			
	pavement, walkways, bike lanes,			
	landscaping. It also includes drainage			
	improvements associated with regional			
	or local master planned drainage			
	facilities			
Wastewater Utilities	Maintenance and development of	Chapter III: Mobility and		
vvasiowator otilitios	wastewater infrastructure or related	Infrastructure		
	improvements related to supply and	Imastructure		
	demand			
Water Utilities		Chapter III. Makiliti.		
vvaler Utilities	Maintenance and development of	Chapter III: Mobility and		
	water infrastructure or related	Infrastructure		
	improvements related to supply and			
	demand and water conservation			
	measures			

As shown in Table 1 above, these CIP categories align with several of the elements of the General Plan. The specific policy statements are provided in Attachment 2, which establishes the framework for making General Plan consistency determinations. Staff has reviewed the proposed capital projects and activities and recommends the adoption of the attached resolution finding the CIP Program and Budget is consistent with the General Plan. The projects are all included within other adopted plans that have been drafted as a result of General Plan policy, and do not interfere with the implementation of other unrelated goals and policies. Many CIP projects are carry-overs from previous years and were previously found to be consistent with the General Plan, but continue to require fiscal year funding allocations and therefore continue to be presented.

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

## E. FISCAL ANALYSIS:

The action before the Planning Commission is finding that the proposed capital improvements and activities are consistent with the General Plan. There is no fiscal impact associated with this overview. The cost associated with the preparation of the report is included within the Community Development Department budget.

The proposed FY 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget estimates sources of \$67.6 million that are available to fund capital improvements and other maintenance and capital outlay expenditures. A majority of the proposed capital project costs, 66% or \$43 million this year, relate to water utilities projects. There is \$22 million in project costs for undergrounding a portion of the Escondido Canal through the San Pasqual Indian Reservation. And there is \$20 million for the Lake Wohlford Dam Project. The Five-Year total is \$202,006,024. This funding is proposed to come from a number of special revenue, capital projects, and enterprise funds to fund the projects outlined in the proposed CIP Program and Budget.

# F. ENVIRONMENTAL STATUS:

The action before the Planning Commission is exempt from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA"). Government Code section 65401 mandates that each fiscal year, the Planning Commission review the CIP of the City for conformity with the Escondido General Plan. The review is not an approval of the individual actions within the CIP Program and Budget. Rather, it is only a determination that the CIP conforms with the General Plan. The individual actions described in the CIP are subject to further environmental review and thus at this point are merely speculative. Staff has reviewed the list of identified projects and has determined that a number of projects will likely involve the need for preparation of environmental documentation in accordance with CEQA. Appropriate CEQA and/or National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) documents may be prepared after a specific project scope is defined but prior to the City's approval of the project itself, including review and approval of any related construction contracts or entitlements. Therefore, the proposed action is not a "Project" as defined in section 15378 of the CEQA Guidelines, which excludes from the definition of "project" "[t]he creation of government funding mechanisms or other government fiscal activities which do not involve any specific project which may result in a potentially significant impact on the environment." (CEQA Guidelines section 15378(b)(4).)

# G. PUBLIC INPUT:

None.

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

## H. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION:

The Planning Commission can concur with staff and determine the CIP is consistent with the General Plan. This is the recommended action. Approval involves the Planning Commission adopting the draft Resolution finding all proposed CIP projects are consistent with the General Plan. The CIP Program and Budget thereafter would be presented to the City Council for adoption. The Planning Commission can determine one or more of the CIP projects are inconsistent with the General Plan, and recommend the City Council modify projects as necessary to implement General Plan goals and policies. This action would result in the Planning Commission forwarding a recommendation to the City Council to modify projects as necessary so the CIP is entirely consistent with the General Plan. If this action is taken, the Planning Commission should identify which projects are inconsistent with the General Plan, cite reasons for its findings, and recommend changes that are necessary for project conformance with the General Plan.

Based on the information in the staff report and subject to the required Findings, staff recommends that the Planning Commission take the following actions:

- 1. Determine that the Fiscal Years 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget is in conformance with the City of Escondido General Plan.
- 2. Approve Planning Commission Resolution No. 2021-09 (Attachment 3).

# **ATTACHMENTS:**

- 1. Draft FY 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget
- 2. Relevant General Plan Goals and Policies
- 3. Draft Planning Commission Resolution No. 2021-09

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

# **ATTACHMENT 1**

# Draft FY 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget June 8, 2021 Planning Commission Agenda Report

Due to the number of pages of Attachment 1, a link has been provided to review the document electronically.

# https://www.escondido.org/Data/Sites/1/media/PDFs/Finance/CIP2020-21.pdf

A hardcopy of the Exhibit is available for review in the Office of the City Clerk during normal business hours. To obtain a copy, please the City Clerk at (760) 839-4617.

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

#### ATTACHMENT 2

#### **Relevant General Plan Goals and Policies**

# June 8, 2021 Planning Commission Agenda Report

To ensure consistency with the General Plan, a review was done of the existing General Plan for any relevant goals and policies. Goals and policies in the General Plan that are not applicable to the CIP Program and Budget consistency review were not included.

- Regional Transportation Planning Policy 1.3 Coordinate local traffic management efforts to be compatible and provide connectivity with adopted circulation plans in the region and regional transportation planning efforts.
- Complete Streets Policy 2.1 Ensure that the existing and future transportation system is interconnected and serves multiple modes of travel, such as walking, biking, transit, and driving for safe and convenient travel.
- Complete Streets Policy 2.2 Provide a safe, efficient and accessible transportation network that meets the needs of users of all ages including seniors, children, disabled persons, and adults.
- Complete Streets Policy 2.5 Design streets in a manner that is sensitive to the local context and recognizes that the needs vary between mixed use, urban, suburban, and rural settings.
- Complete Streets Policy 2.6 Ensure that the entire right-of-way is designed to accommodate appropriate modes of transportation.
- Complete Streets Policy 2.7 Remove barriers, where feasible, to allow people of all abilities to access the mobility infrastructure serving the community.
- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.1 Prepare and regularly update a Pedestrian Master Plan that identifies and defines the following: level of service standards for pedestrian facilities; type and location of pedestrian-oriented streets and pathways; way-finding program, standards for sidewalk width, improvements, amenities, and street crossings; outline and timeframe of needed public improvements; and developer responsibilities
- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.2 Develop and manage pedestrian facilities to maintain an acceptable Level of Service as defined in the Pedestrian Master Plan.
- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.4 Preserve and enhance pedestrian connectivity within existing neighborhoods via the Escondido Creek trail, sidewalks, and trails, and require a pedestrian network in new developments that provides efficient and well-designed connections to adjacent land uses, commercial districts, schools, and parks.

Planning Commission Meeting

- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.6 Enhance pedestrian visibility by enforcing parking restrictions at intersection approaches, improving street lighting, and identifying required clearances to minimize obstructions.
- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.7 Encourage and support the development of pedestrian-friendly mixed-use, commercial, transit-oriented, and multi-tenant office districts with active, accessible, connected, and unique public spaces that promote walking.
- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.8 Repair sidewalk and pedestrian paths in the public-right-of-way that impede pedestrian travel, and maintain the pedestrian network in a manner that facilitates accessibility and safety.
- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.9 Support "safe routes to schools" programming and partner with schools, non-profit organizations, and transit agencies with the goal of encouraging more children to walk and bike to school in a safe environment.
- Pedestrian Network Policy 3.10 Design and construct pedestrian-friendly streetscape improvements that reduce stormwater and pollutant runoff into the drainage system, using such techniques as urban bio-swales for the filtering of pollutants and permeable hardscapes.
- Bicycle Network Policy 4.1 Maintain and implement a Bicycle Master Plan that enhances existing bicycle routes and facilities; defines gaps and needed improvements; prescribes an appropriate Level of Service; outlines standards for their design and safety; describes funding resources; and involves the community.
- Bicycle Network Policy 4.2 Develop and manage bicycle facilities to maintain an acceptable Level of Service as defined in the Bicycle Master Plan.
- Bicycle Network Policy 4.4 Develop bicycle routes and facilities that connect to transit stations, employment and commercial centers, schools, libraries, cultural centers, parks, the Escondido Creek trail, and other frequently visited destinations throughout the community and region where they do not already exist.
- Bicycle Network Policy 4.6 Incorporate bicycle parking facilities in public places such as transit stops, libraries, and parks where feasible.
- Transit System Policy 5.9 Construct, when appropriate, transit facilities such as bus pullouts on Prime Arterials, Major Roads, and Collector streets
- Transit System Policy 5.10 Provide safe and efficient multimodal access to and within transit stations, complying with ADA standards.
- Street Network Policy 7.1 Plan, design, and regulate roadways in accordance with the street classification in the Circulation Element Diagram.
- Street Network Policy 7.4 Provide adequate traffic safety measures on all new roadways and strive to provide adequate traffic safety measures on existing roadways (subject to fiscal and environmental considerations). These measures may include, but not be limited to, appropriate levels of maintenance, proper street design, traffic control

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

devices (signs, signals, striping), street lighting, and coordination with the school districts and other agencies.

- Street Network Policy 7.5 Provide high priority to funding capital improvement projects that complete links to the circulation system, relieve existing congestion in the urban core as defined by the city, correct unsafe conditions on existing streets and/or improve the regional circulation system.
- Street Network Policy 7.9 Synchronize traffic signals where feasible and appropriate to facilitate the flow of through traffic, thus enhancing the movement of vehicles and goods through the city while reducing fuel consumption and air pollution
- Traffic Calming Traffic Calming Policy 9.1 Reduce congestion in areas surrounding schools, parks, and other activity centers by applying effective traffic management solutions.
- Traffic Calming Policy 9.2 Encourage the use of innovative methods for traffic control (such as roundabouts, curb extensions, and traffic circles) that add character and create opportunity for improved aesthetics while effectively managing traffic.
- Water System Policy 12.2 Maintain adequate water supply, treatment, and distribution capacity to meet normal and emergency situations to provide a minimum standard of 540 gallons per day per household. This standard should be periodically reviewed and modified by updates to the Water Master Plan to account for changes in water supply, demands, and conservation practices.
- Water System Policy 12.11 Continue to implement water conservation programs, such as requirements for water efficient landscaping and enforcement of water wise regulations, and amend as appropriate to reflect evolving technologies and best practices.
- Wastewater System Policy 13.2 Ensure that the Hale Avenue Resource Recovery Facility (HARRF) and supporting infrastructure provide sufficient capacity to meet normal and emergency demand for existing and future growth based on a minimum standard of 250 gallons per day for each residence served by the HARRF. This standard should be periodically reviewed and modified by updates to the Wastewater Master Plan to account for changes in sanitary waste generation and conservation practices.
- Wastewater System Policy 13.3 Design the wastewater system to support development of properties at the intensities specified by the General Plan Land Use Plan.
- Wastewater System Policy 13.10 Design wastewater facilities to implement practices that avoid sewage spills affecting stream courses and reservoirs.
- Storm Drainage Policy 14.2 Improve the existing storm drainage system by correcting identified deficiencies.
- Storm Drainage Policy 14.9 Construct nonstructural flood protection methods that incorporate vegetation to protect and stabilize land areas as an alternative to constructing concrete channels.

Planning Commission Meeting

- Storm Drainage Policy 14.11 Maintain flood control channels and storm drains through periodic dredging, repair, desilting, and clearing to prevent losses in effective use, subject to approval from appropriate state and federal agencies
- Storm Drainage Policy 14.13 Design and maintain detention facilities that are environmentally sustainable and compatible with surrounding uses to maximize vector control, manage flows, and maximize opportunities for conservation of water.
- Housing Policy 2.2 Increase homeownership in the city through education, availability, and affordability.
- Housing Policy 2.4 Seek ways to eliminate all forms of discrimination based on race, ancestry, national origin or color, religion, sex, familial or marital status, disability, medical condition, age, sexual orientation, or source of income in obtaining housing.
- Housing Policy 3.1 Maintain and enhance the existing housing stock as a source of low and moderate-cost housing and as a conservation measure.
- Housing Policy 3.2 Seek ways to eliminate substandard housing through continued enforcement of the Health and Safety Code and the provision of programs which facilitate the maintenance and rehabilitation of housing.
- Health and Wellness Policy 1.1 Ensure adequate and convenient physical access to healthcare, parks, libraries, cultural arts, schools, childcare facilities, and services for all residents.
- Health and Wellness Policy 1.7 Continue to provide city parks and recreation programs and support private recreational programs that provide opportunities for residents of all age groups to participate in activities as a means to promote a healthy lifestyle.
- Health and Wellness Policy 1.11 Encourage the revitalization of existing urban areas to achieve improvements in overall public health by promoting a healthier living environment that includes walkable neighborhoods and access to recreation and open space, healthy foods, medical services, and transit.
- Parks and Recreation Policy 2.2 Provide an adequate system of neighborhood, community, urban, and regional parks and related recreational facilities/services for incorporation into the open space system.
- Parks and Recreation Policy 2.3 Provide a minimum of 5.9 acres of developed active Neighborhood, Community, and Urban parks in addition to 5.9 acres of passive park land/open space for habitat preservation and additional recreational opportunities totaling 11.8 active and passive acres per 1,000 dwelling units. School playground areas can be included as park acreage if these facilities are approved by the school district(s) and open to the public as determined by the City Council.
- Parks and Recreation Policy 2.5 Design and construct Urban, Neighborhood, Community, and Regional Parks consistent with the standards and guidelines in Figures V-4 and V-5.

Planning Commission Meeting

- Parks and Recreation Policy 2.11 Undertake a parks acquisition and improvement program to accommodate future growth needs.
- Parks and Recreation Policy 2.16 Assist in the coordinated planning, development, and maintenance of unique regional amenities within and adjacent to the community, including Kit Carson Park, Daley Ranch, Lake Wohlford Regional Park, Lake Dixon Regional Park, San Dieguito River Valley Park and Felicita County Park.
- Parks and Recreation Policy 2.17 Improve Escondido Creek Trail as a linear park with amenities including but not limited to: shade and turf areas, community gardens, seating areas, exercise courses, and access to adjacent park and recreation facilities.
- Parks and Recreation Policy 2.20 Provide public and support private recreational programs that serve residents of all ages, backgrounds, and interests.
- Library Services Policy 3.3 Concentrate resources on improving and maintaining adequate staffing; inventory of print; media and computer resources; and community library services and programs for all residents. Review periodically to ensure adequacy.
- Library Services Policy 3.5 Maintain libraries to be conveniently accessible to pedestrians, public transit, and other modes of transportation
- Library Services Policy 3.6 Provide library facilities and programs appropriate for all members of the community and include services for those who cannot conveniently physically access a library
- Cultural Arts Policy 4.2 Encourage the use of publicly owned facilities and spaces for the display of local art and for other artistic and cultural events.
- Cultural Arts Policy 4.3 Maintain guidelines for the placement of art works that considers public visibility, public safety, and community enjoyment.
- Emergency Services Policy 1.4 Plan for the continued function of essential facilities such as hospitals, fire stations, and emergency command centers following a major disaster to facilitate post-disaster recovery.
- Emergency Services Policy 1.5 Identify locations and facilities in the city to be used as shelters by the community during emergency situations and establish programs to quickly enable operation of these shelters and communicate access information for residents.
- Emergency Services Policy 1.7 Provide for adequate water storage and flow to meet current and future service needs as defined in the city's Water Master Plan.
- Fire Protection Policy 2.2 Provide Fire Department response times for no less than 90 percent of all emergency responses with engine companies by achieving the following service standard:
  - Provide an initial response time of seven and one-half (7½) minutes for all structure fire and emergency Advanced Life Support (ALS) calls and a maximum response time of ten (10) minutes for supporting companies in urbanized areas of the city

Planning Commission Meeting

- Fire Protection Policy 2.5 Commit to the use of state-of-the-art equipment, technologies, and management techniques for fire prevention and suppression.
- Fire Protection Policy 2.11 Maintain and enhance an emergency vehicle traffic signal activation system to improve fire station service area coverage in conjunction with planned improvements to the city's major circulation system.
- Fire Protection Policy 2.17 Maintain programs to minimize impacts on sensitive biological habitat and species when suppressing wildland fires, when feasible.
- Police Services Policy 3.2 Maintain an initial response time for Priority 1 calls of no more than five (5) minutes and an initial response time for Priority 2 calls of no more than six and one-half (6½) minutes. Constantly review these standards to ensure their adequacy and appropriateness in consideration of resource availability.
- Police Services Policy 3.3 Maintain adequate levels of sworn officers and civilian personnel to support law enforcement operations based on community needs in order to meet response time standards.
- Police Services Policy 3.4 Commit to the use of state-of-the-art equipment, technologies, and management techniques to assure adequate levels of police protection.
- Police Services Policy 3.6 Allocate resources to organize patrol areas, and regularly communicate with and involve community, school, and civic organizations to encourage community-based crime prevention efforts such as implementing Community Oriented Policing and Problem Solving (COPPS) strategies
- Code Enforcement Policy 4.1 Provide facilities and staffing to maintain an aggressive and visible code enforcement program to ensure that existing properties meet health and safety standards.
- Trail Network Policy 2.2 Expand and improve the Escondido Creek trail within the city's trail network that links urban areas with rural and open space areas to promote opportunities for recreation, education, interpretation, and alternative transportation.
- Trail Network Policy 2.3 Integrate trails into new and existing developments, and ensure that trails safely interface with neighborhoods.
- Trail Network Policy 2.4 Establish a continuous network of landscaped pedestrian and bicycle paths within urbanized areas that provides internal circulation and links Escondido's districts and neighborhoods.
- Trail Network Policy 2.5 Ensure safe and efficient maintenance of trails that minimize impacts to the environment.
- Wage and Jobs / Housing Policy 2.1 Implement programs and support efforts to increase Escondido's median income and wage by: actively fostering entrepreneurial opportunities, recruiting new businesses, annexing key unincorporated lands, and encouraging existing business expansions that increases employment densities

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

and retains skilled workers whose wages exceed the San Diego Region's median per capita income, and bringing new dollars into the local economy.

- Small Business and Entrepreneurialship Policy 3.1 Provide assistance and information to facilitate the attraction, retention, and expansion of small and medium size businesses with good growth potential.
- Small Business and Entrepreneurialship Policy 3.4 Implement marketing programs to support local businesses and promote Escondido as an ideal location for business development and growth. Emphasize buying locally, including business-to-business transactions.
- Marketing and Image Policy 7.1 Promote the identity of Escondido and its key districts through a variety of efforts, including but not limited to: the city's website, telecasts, social media, newsletter publications, branding/logo development, and image enhancement and marketing programs.
- Marketing and Image Policy 7.3 Market the City's economic opportunities to encourage entrepreneurial investment, attract new businesses, and foster job growth that contributes to the diversification and stabilization of the local economy
- Long-Term Economic Wellbeing Policy 8.1 Work with businesses and other stakeholders to identify and implement programs and measures for the revitalization and/or transition of underutilized and obsolete employment areas. This may include:
  - a) Developing incentives and other strategies to promote reinvestment.

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

**ATTACHMENT 3** 

Planning Commission

Hearing Date: June 8, 2021

Effective Date: June 9, 2021

PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 2021-09

A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ESCONDIDO, CALIFORNIA, FINDING THE FISCAL YEAR 2021/22 TO 2024/25 CIP PROGRAM AND BUDGET IN CONFORMANCE WITH THE ESCONDIDO GENERAL PLAN PURSUANT TO SECTION 65401 OF THE GOVERNMENT CODE.

APPLICANT: City of Escondido

WHEREAS, each year the Planning Commission must review all capital programs and activities that may be planned, initiated, or constructed during the ensuing fiscal year(s) for conformity with the General Plan as required by State Planning and Zoning Law (Government Code section 65401); and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission has been furnished a copy of and reviewed the Draft 2021/22 to 2024/25 Capital Improvement Program ("CIP") Program and Budget; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission held a meeting on June 8, 2021, at which it considered the proposed CIP, the General Plan, staff reports, and the testimony and evidence of all those wishing to be heard; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission finds that the determination of whether the Draft 2021/22 to 2024/25 "CIP" Program and Budget is consistent with the Escondido General Plan is not subject to the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") pursuant

15

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

to CEQA Guidelines section 15378 because the action is not a "Project." Rather, the

action relates to the creation of government funding mechanisms or other government

fiscal activities that do not involve any specific project that may result in a potentially

significant impact on the environment.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Planning Commission of the

City of Escondido:

1. That the above recitations are true and correct.

2. That the Planning Commission hereby determines that those

projects in the Draft 2021/22 to 2024/25 CIP Program and Budget

conform to and are consistent with the General Plan.

16

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

PASSED, ADOPTED AND APPROVED by a majority vote of the Planning Commission of the City of Escondido, California, at a regular meeting held on the 8<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2021, by the following vote, to wit:

	AYES:	COMMISSIONERS:
	NOES:	COMMISSIONERS:
	ABSTAINED:	COMMISSIONERS:
	ABSENT:	COMMISSIONERS:
		KATHARINE BARBA, Chair Escondido Planning Commission
ATTEST:		
	ONG, Secretary of Planning Commi	
	I hereby certify	that the foregoing Resolution was passed at the time and by
the vote ab	ove stated.	

Joanne Tasher, Minutes Clerk Escondido Planning Commission



# PLANNING COMMISSION

Agenda Item No.: <u>H.2</u> Date: June 8, 2021

PROJECT NO	MBEK / NAME:	HOUSING AND C	COMMUNITY	INVESTMENT	STUDY (HCIS)
REQUEST: Re	eceive and file the	e informational rep	ort and status	update	

**LOCATION:** CityWide

APN / APNS: N/A

**GENERAL PLAN / ZONING: N/A** 

**APPLICANT:** Community Development

Department

**PRIMARY REPRESENTATIVE:**Adam Finestone, City Planner

**DISCRETIONARY ACTIONS REQUESTED: N/A** 

**PREVIOUS ACTIONS:** Previous informational presentations to the Planning Commission as described in the staff report.

PROJECT PLANNER: Adam Finestone, City Planner

**CEQA RECOMMENDATION:** The informational presentation qualifies for exemptions pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15262 (Feasibility and Planning Studies) and section 15306 (Information Collection).

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: Receive and file

**REQUESTED ACTION: None** 

**CITY COUNCIL HEARING REQUIRED:** □ YES ⋈ NO

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

## A. BACKGROUND:

The City of Escondido ("City") was awarded grant funding to develop three different housing plans/studies: 1) a Housing Element Update, 2) a Sector Feasibility Study, and 3) a specific plan for the East Valley Target Area. These three housing studies and plans will be linked together, through a common work program theme, called the Housing Community and Investment Study ("HCIS"). The HCIS is a coordination of related studies intended to identify a comprehensive vision for maintaining, preserving, and developing housing to address Escondido's quality of life needs. Background Project material is provided on the City's project website at <a href="https://www.escondido.org/hcis.aspx">https://www.escondido.org/hcis.aspx</a>.

# B. <u>SUMMARY OF REQUEST:</u>

Review and file the informational report and status update.

# C. <u>SUPPLEMENTAL DETAILS OF REQUEST:</u>

During the course of the HCIS work program it is anticipated that the Planning Commission would continue to receive regular status updates about the plans and studies. An overview of the remaining project milestones and study session schedule is provided below. The "review meetings" schedule is reflected below, in Table 1.

**Table 1: HCIS Planning Commission Review Schedule** 

Meeting No.	Topic Or Discussion Item Covered	Milestone or
		Target Date
1	General overview about the process	March 23, 2021
2	RHNA Overview	April 13, 2021
3	Draft 2021-2029 Housing Element Goals, Policies, and	April 27, 2021
	Programs Review	
4	Sector Feasibility Study Overview	June 8, 2021
5	Draft East Valley Specific Plan Overview	June 22, 2021
6	Planning Commission public hearing and recommendation to	June 22, 2021
	the City Council to consider the Housing Element and Sector	
	Feasibility Study	
6	Draft EIR Overview	Summer 2021
7	Planning Commission public hearing and recommendation to	Fall 2021
	City Council and East Valley Specific Plan.	

It is important to note that the Housing Element portion of the HCIS is being pulled from the overall project timeline and is now scheduled to be considered by the Planning Commission on July 13, 2021. The purpose of this change is because jurisdictions on 8-year planning cycles must adopt their Housing Elements no later than 120 days after the statutory deadline or will be required to revise their Housing Elements every four years. To remain on an eight-year planning cycle, the

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

City of Escondido must adopt its Housing Element within 120 calendar days from the statutory due date of April 15, 2021. If adopted after this date, Government Code section 65588(e)(4) requires the Housing Element be revised every four years until adopting at least two consecutive revisions by the statutory deadline.

For more information on Housing Element adoption requirements, please visit HCD's website at:

https://hcd.ca.gov/community-development/housing-element/housing-element-memos/docs/sb375 final100413.pdf

#### D. PROJECT ANALYSIS:

The June 8, 2021 Planning Commission meeting consists of a review of the Sector Feasibility Study. The SFS was prepared by Kaiser Marston Associates, Inc., in consultation with City staff from the Community Development (Housing and Planning) and Engineering Services departments. On June 8, 2021, City staff and the consultant team will provide results from the Sector Feasibility Study. The June 8, 2021 PowerPoint presentation will be used to facilitate the discussion of this item.

The Planning and Zoning Law requires each county and city to adopt a comprehensive, long-term general plan for its physical development, and the development of certain lands outside its boundaries, that includes, among other mandatory elements, a Housing Element. Having an updated Housing Element is extremely important for local cities and counties. Overall, Housing Elements serve as a strategy to help cities prepare for the future and further evaluate affordable/workforce housing policies.

When developing the scope of work for the HCIS, some City Officials recommended that the City consider establishing an Inclusionary Housing Program, which would require or incentivize the production of affordable housing when new market-rate housing is built. However, few housing policies have attracted as much attention or controversy in recent years as inclusionary housing. While advocates view inclusionary zoning as a way to integrate affordable homes into new developments with little subsidy from the public, critics of inclusionary housing claim that that inclusionary housing policies adversely impact the cost and availability of market-rate homes. The concern is that inclusionary housing policies would impose costs that can't be supported by project budgets and lead to reductions in the supply of new housing and, ironically, higher housing costs overall.

During the course of developing the draft 2021-2029 Housing Element, the housing needs assessment and affordability analysis demonstrates an underlying demand for an Inclusionary Housing Program in the City of Escondido (on a socio-economic basis). However, before considering the adoption of new inclusionary housing policies, the City must first research and understand if inclusionary housing policies would measurably impact the housing production and/or the level of market prices or rents in Escondido. This could be performed through market analysis or something called a "sector feasibility study." Since the HCIS also consists of a new specific plan and land use regulations for the East Valley area, the City could also leverage the

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

same sector feasibility analysis to evaluate the different housing types and densities that could be built in the specific plan to ensure that developed standards and guidelines are viable for implementation. Therefore, the City incorporated a Sector Feasibility Study into the overall scope of the HCIS to better understand the variables associated with different land use and housing policies. Altogether, the three studies and plans that have been incorporated into the HCIS work program will lead to more informed decision-making and ultimately address how (and if) the city can accommodate growth demands while enhancing the city's community character and quality of life.

On June 8, 2021, the Planning Commission will review and discuss the results of the Sector Feasibility Study. The Sector Feasibility Study explores all the direct and indirect costs associated with new construction to better understand market conditions and patterns of housing and community development policy.

# Overview of the Sector Feasibility Study

The Sector Feasibility Study presents the results of research regarding the economic feasibility of constructing a variety of for-sale and for-rent multifamily residential development prototypes. The goal was to identify the degree to which each of the prototypes could be feasibly developed under specific market conditions that impact both the expenditures and revenues associated with a development concept. In addition to the results of the market rate analysis, the study also considered the feasibility of mixed-income and 100% affordable development projects for the various prototypes.

The Study considered three for-sale and four for-rent prototypes, with densities ranging from 20 to 100 dwelling units per acre. The prototypes are representative of projects that are currently under review, reasonably anticipated, under development, or recently completed in the City of Escondido. As such, they are not project-specific, and actual expenditures and revenues will necessarily vary.

The following table provides a snapshot of the economic feasibility of construction for the seven prototypes considered in the study:

Table II-2: Financial Feasibility of Development Prototypes					
FOR-SALE RENTAL					
For-S	ale Development Prototypes	Prototype Financial Feasibility	Rental Development Prototypes Financia		Prototype Financial Feasibility
Α	Townhomes	Yes	D	Garden Apartments	Yes
В	Stacked Flats with Tuck-Under Parking	No	E	Stacked Flats with Tuck-Under Parking	Yes
С	Stacked Flats over Podium/ Subterranean	No	F	Stacked Flats with Wrap Parking	Yes
			G	Stacked Flats over Podium/ Subterranean Parking	No

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

Under current market conditions, the table identifies one of the three for-sale prototypes (townhomes) as financially feasible, and three of the four for-rent prototypes (all but stacked flats over podium/subterranean parking) as financially feasible.

As noted above, feasibility is dependent on both the expenditures and revenues anticipated for any project/prototype. The study used a methodology involving residual land value and typical acquisition costs. Residual land value is a means by which a development project's expenditures and revenues, excluding land costs, are calculated in order to determine the value of the land; that is, what a developer is willing and able to pay for the land after all other costs are factored in. By comparing this to typical acquisition costs, the feasibility of a development prototype can be ascertained. This concept is described in more detail in the Study.

The Study extended the analysis of the determinations identified above to consider the effect of inclusionary housing requirements on the feasibility of selected prototypes, as well as the feasibility of affordable housing projects (100% affordable; for-rent) using the most likely government funding sources for affordable housing. The extended analysis revealed that only one of the residential prototypes (for-sale townhomes) remained viable as a mixed-income project; and identified a financing gap of \$148,000 per unit in a 100% affordable housing project. The Study provides detailed information to support these conclusions.

It must be noted that the Study was based on a point-in-time analysis, and that changes in both expenditures and revenues will affect the feasibility of a project over time. Currently, the major factors that might affect feasibility on the expenditure side are related to construction costs; on the revenue side, they are rising home prices, partially fueled by historically low interest rates. While not fully known, the impact of the COVID-19 pandemic also weighs heavily on the feasibility of development. (Data used for the Study was collected in mid-2020; home prices and construction costs have both risen significantly since that time.) Additional study limitations are identified in the Study.

# E. FISCAL ANALYSIS:

The action before the Planning Commission is an overview of the next steps toward developing HCIS work program in order for the HCIS to be considered by both the Planning Commission and City Council for action in late summer 2021. There is no fiscal impact associated with this overview. The cost associated with the preparation of the report is included within the Community Development Department budget.

HCD has supported the HCIS planning effort by awarding the City \$310,000 through an SB 2 Planning Grant; and \$500,000 through a Local Early Action Planning ("LEAP") Grant Program. Preparing the draft Housing Element, Sector Feasibility Study, and East Valley Specific Plan and facilitating additional public outreach of the HCIS will be covered by the existing Community Development Department budget, which was recently augmented to account for planning grant awards.

Planning Commission Meeting

Date: June 8, 2021

## F. ENVIRONMENTAL STATUS:

The action before the Planning Commission is exempt from further California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") review, as separate and independent bases, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15262 (Feasibility and Planning Studies) and section 15306 (Information Collection). This organizational and administrative activity relates to the ongoing study and evaluation of the feasibility of moving forward with various policies or programs related to one or more General Plan amendments or adopting a new specific plan for the East Valley planning area. The Sector Feasibility Study is a data-gathering effort in support of the HCIS, which includes two other documents (the Housing Element and the East Valley Specific Plan) on which the City has not yet taken action. Further, the HCIS considers environmental factors, will not have a legally binding effect on any later activities, and does not itself result in a serious or major disturbance to an environmental resource. The Planning Commission will provide direction as appropriate to facilitate additional public review of all aspects of the HCIS. The June 8, 2021 Agenda Report is for information purposes only, and does not commit the City to a course of action that could adversely impact the environment.

Public input received and technical information prepared during the proposed process would be utilized in preparing a future environmental review document to support the HCIS work program. The City must prepare an environmental document prior to adopting the Housing Element Update and the East Valley Specific Plan portions of the HCIS.

# **G. PUBLIC INPUT:**

The City is undertaking this public involvement process to help engage residents, businesses, and other community members in the development of three different housing studies and plans. On June 10, 2020, the City Council considered and endorsed a Public Participation Plan ("Outreach Plan") and associated timeline to involve the community. Among other things, the proposed work plan and schedule proposes a series of meetings with the Planning Commission to discuss different aspects and components related to the HCIS. The Outreach Plan can be accessed through the link provided below:

https://www.escondido.org/Data/Sites/1/media/PDFs/Planning/EastValleySpecificPlan2020/HCI SPPPJune102020.pdf.

The City has also developed a periodic review page that can be accessed online at the link below to help the public access key documents. Informational reports and data generated during the review will be available for the public to view online:

https://www.escondido.org/hcis.aspx.

Project Name: HCIS Planning Commission Meeting Date: June 8, 2021

# H. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION:

Receive report and file.

# **ATTACHMENTS:**

None





Agenda Item No. <u>H.3</u> Date: June 8, 2021

June 8, 2021

TO: Planning Commission

FROM: Mike Strong, Director of Community Development

SUBJECT: Discussion on scope of a "Green Infrastructure Plan"

No materials available. Planning Commission discussion only.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION: None (Planning Chair Kate Barba)